

THE RECORDINGS OF LOUIS METCALF

An Annotated Tentative Personnelo-Discography

METCALF, LOUIS (, Jr.) (b Webster Groves, MO, 28 Feb 1905; d New York, 27 Oct 1981). Trumpeter. He played for Charlie Creath in St. Louis (c 1918 – 1923) before touring with Jimmy Cooper’s Black and White Revue (1923-4). He then settled in New York, where he made his first recordings, accompanying classic blues singers (from 1924). He performed with Willie ‘The Lion’ Smith and Sidney Bechet (1924), Elmer Snowden (1925), Charlie Johnson (1926), and Sam Wooding (1927); he also played for the show *4-11-44* and recorded with Duke Ellington (1926). From 1927 to 1928 he was a member of Ellington’s Cotton Club Orchestra, where he made fluent use of muted and bluesy effects and, through his high range, supplied a contrast to Bubber Miley’s growling trumpet playing. He performed with Jelly Roll Morton (1928) and the Luis Russell Orchestra, with which he recorded under the leadership of both Russell and King Oliver (1929). In the early 1930s Metcalf formed a band in Montreal, then travelled around the Midwest, leading bands and working briefly with Fletcher Henderson. In 1936 he returned to New York, where he formed a band which included Lester Young, Billie Holiday, and Hot Lips Page. During World War II he ran a social club and supported the *Music Dial*, a magazine dedicated to civil rights. He resumed playing as leader of the International Band in Montreal (1946- c1952) and spent the remainder of his career performing in clubs in New York. (B. Kernfeld, *The New Grove Dictionary of Jazz*)

STYLISTICS

STYLE

Metcalf’s style is determined by the way St. Louis trumpeters played. They played in a “Western” manner, using a rhythmic conception similar to the New Orleans musicians, but more influenced by ragtime and thus somewhat stiffer. Metcalf has a habit of dropping pitch at the end of his notes and bending his notes downward to the consecutive notes.

TONE

He owns a squeezed tone with a muddy sound – which may depend on the recording quality. In 1926/7 his tone grows much clearer than before, becoming a real „fat“ and mellow tone.

VIBRATO

He uses a wide vibrato.

TIME

He tends to rush his phrases and be hasty, thus not always swinging.

PHRASING

Metcalf’s phrasing is dominated by the trumpet style of his home-town St. Louis, with frequent Ragtime derived rhythmical elements. He tends to improvise double-time phrases. After his Ellington period he becomes technically more virtuoso and masterly, sometimes resembling Jabbo Smith with his legato style.

The author would like the reader to know that some of the listed personnels are not as listed in the common discographies, but are the result of the author’s own intensive listening, and might yet possibly not find the agreement of other listeners! In some cases they might even be wrong, but still given with sincere opinion.

This personnelo-discography is based on RUST, JAZZ AND RAGTIME RECORDS 1897 - 1942.

Personnels are taken from this source, but modified in the light of earlier or subsequent research or on the strength of my own listening, discussed with our listening group or other interested collectors.

- Documented, most certain and aurally absolutely obvious identifications are listed thus: **Louis Metcalf**
- Probable, generally agreed, but not documented identifications are listed in italics, thus: *Louis Metcalf*
- Not attributable identifications – although the musician in question might be an otherwise well-known person – are listed thus: **unknown**
- If a possible identification for an otherwise unknown musician is suggested by the author without the possibility to prove the factual evidence, it is listed thus: (*Louis Metcalf*)

When feeling certain without a musician’s documented presence, I have not refrained from altering Rust’s statements without using italics. In any case, my statements are open to discussion and I would appreciate any contribution - pro or contra!

As always in my discographies on this website I have written recording sessions with their headings, dates, titles and names of musicians in italics, whenever I am convinced that the eponymous musician of this discography is not part of the accompanying group of this session! Documented names of musicians if known – in recording ledgers or on record labels – are listed in bold letters.

This discography still is - and will certainly be - a work in progress for a long time, if not eternally. Yet, on the way to a definite discography of all jazz recordings before 1942 - which certainly will never be possible - it is intended to fill some gaps that have not been treated before.

LOUIS METCALF

001	HAZEL MEYERS	Choo Choo Jazzers	New York,	Jun. 21-26, 1924
	Hazel Meyers – voc;			
	<i>Louis Metcalf</i> – tpt;			
	Louis Hooper – pno; Joe Davis - effects			
	31597	War Horse Mama	Ajax 17047,	Document DOCD-5431
	31599	Cold Weather Papa	Ajax 17047,	Document DOCD-5431

After repeated listening I definitely hear Louis Metcalf and Louis Hooper. Metcalf is much more assured than the trumpet player of the session before (Miley), and owns a looser style. This might be Metcalf's first recording.

Notes:

- RR 86-6: *unlisted*
- Rust*3: ? *Bubber Miley - c; Bob Fuller - cl; Louis Hooper – p.*
- BGR*2,*3: *poss Bubber Miley, cnt; Bob Fuller, clt; Louis Hooper, pno.*
- BGR*4: *poss Bubber Miley, c; Louis Hooper, p; unknown, effects*
- Rust*6: *Bubber Miley, c; Bob Fuller cl; Louis Hooper, p.*
- W. Bryant, *Ajax Records: no personnel.*
- Bob Hitchens, *Choo Choo Jazzers, VJM 175: Bubber Miley (t) prob Louis Hooper (p) Joe Davis (effects)*
- Scherman/Eriksson/Anderby/Wallen, *Bubber Miley Disco:*

002	HELEN GROSS	Choo Choo Jazzers	New York,	Jun. 21-26, 1924
	Helen Gross – voc;			
	<i>Louis Metcalf</i> – tpt; Bob Fuller - clt;			
	<i>Louis Hooper</i> - pno			
	31609	Rockin' Chair Blues	Ajax 17046,	Document DOCD-5477
	31611	Sorrowful Blues	Ajax 17046,	Document DOCD-5477

Bob Fuller OK. The trumpet player has similarities to Bubber Miley, but shows more rhythmic freedom and slurs in many notes that I do not know from Miley – and another vibrato. He might indeed be Metcalf with his somewhat squeezed notes. And he shows only very little Dunn influence. This might be Metcalf's first recording.

I do not hear anything reminding me of Cliff Jackson and after repeated listening I would name Hooper as pianist. I think to hear Hooper here with his flat left hand (no oom-pah) and his use of blues/boogie devices.

Notes:

- RR 77-6: *not listed*
- W. Bryant, *Ajax Records: no personnel per Hooper.*
- BGR*4: *Bubber Miley, c; Bob Fuller, cl; Cliff Jackson, p.*
- Rust*6: *Bubber Miley, c; Bob Fuller, cl; Cliff Jackson, p.*
- Scherman/Eriksson/Anderby/Wallen, *Bubber Miley Disco: Bubber Miley (tp); Bob Fuller (cl); Cliff Jackson (p)*

003	HELEN GROSS	Choo Choo Jazzers	New York,	Jun. 21-26, 1924
	Helen Gross – voc;			
	<i>Louis Metcalf</i> – tpt; unknown - pno			
	31613	What'll I Do?	Ajax 17049,	Document DOCD-5477

“What'll I Do ?” might possibly be accompanied by different musicians. The trumpet player seems to be Metcalf. Piano shows no personal traces. No clarinet here. This tune is not a waltz, but has a four-four rhythm.

Notes:

- *Jazz Directory Vol. 4: not listed*
- RR 77-6: *not listed*
- W. Bryant, *Ajax Records: no personnel per Hooper.*
- BGR*4: *Bubber Miley, c; Bob Fuller, cl; Cliff Jackson, p.*
- Rust*6: *Bubber Miley, c; Bob Fuller, cl; Cliff Jackson, p.*

004	HAZEL MEYERS		New York,	Jun. 21-26, 1924
	Hazel Meyers – voc;			
	<i>Louis Metcalf</i> – tpt; Louis Hooper – pno			
	31622	He Used To Be Mine (But You Can Have Him Now)	Ajax 17082	not on LP/CD
	31624	Lost My Sweetie Blues	Ajax 17077,	Document DOCD-5431

Unfortunately, we do not have the first title on LP/CD. This is certainly Metcalf on trumpet, as he uses to bend his notes what Rex Stewart does not, at least not to this degree. Stewart is more Armstrong inclined, whereas Metcalf obviously was much impressed by Bubber Miley's style, which he follows to some degree without being as stiff as Miley. Insofar there is a lot of Johnny Dunn influence with Metcalf - yet changed into a much looser and less military style - which you do not hear with Stewart. Chilton, Who's Who In Jazz: “*During following year (1924 – KBR) (Metcalf) spent several months with Willie The Lion Smith at the Rhythm Club.*” RR 86/3, Louis Metcalf: “*At age 17*

(1922 – KBR) he hit Broadway in New York City to become a jazzier with the Julian Arthur combo that toured with Jimmy Cooper's famous *Black and White revue*." Accordingly it cannot be stated firmly that Metcalf "did not arrive in New York until 19 August 1924" (which I cannot read out of Storyville 2002/03, p. 198! – KBR). Hooper is the pianist.

Notes:

- RR 86-6: *Rex Stewart, cnt; Jake Frazier, tbn; Louis Hooper, pno, per Hooper.*
- W. Bryant, *Ajax Records: personnel per Hooper: Louis Metcalfe, c; Louis Hooper, p (second title); no personnel (first title)*
- BGR*4: *Louis Metcalf, c; Louis Hooper, p.*
- Rust*6: *Louis Metcalf, c; Louis Hooper, p.*

005 HAZEL MEYERS the Choo Choo Jazzers Hazel Meyers – voc; <i>Louis Metcalf</i> – tpt (2); Bob Fuller – clt (1); Louis Hooper – pno	New York,	Jun. 21-26, 1924
31630 You'll Never Have No Luck By Quitin' Me (sic)	Ajax 17054,	Document DOCD-5431
31631 Lonesome For That Man Of Mine	Ajax 17054,	Document DOCD-5431

This probably is Bob Fuller, yet a bit unfamiliar, playing only very short phrases. But bending the notes is Fuller's. The pianist very probably is Hooper as piano playing on both sides is compatible to Hooper's style. Possibly Hooper did not recognize his own playing on the first title because of some approximations to classic or symphonic piano accompaniments. (Whether Joe Davis played piano – and if so, how - I do not know.)

On the second title I hear Metcalf, whose tone is not as clear as Miley's, but a bit mushy (see session 004 above), and whose phrasing is much looser than Miley's. There certainly are some Miley licks, but I see it possible that Metcalf was asked to copy Miley a bit, and he used the most obvious licks from Miley's style. The pianist seems to be the same as on first title.

Notes:

- RR 86-6: *Bob Fuller, clt; not Louis Hooper, pno, on 31630, Bubber Miley, cnt and Louis Hooper, pno on 31631.*
- W. Bryant, *Ajax Records: personnel per Hooper (first title): Bob Fuller, cl; Louis Hooper, p; (second title): Bubber Miley, c; Louis Hooper, p.*
- BGR*4: *Bubber Miley, c; or Bob Fuller, cl; Louis Hooper, p.*
- Rust*6: *Bob Fuller, cl; unknown, p; or Bubber Miley, c; Louis Hooper, p*

006 HELEN GROSS Choo Choo Jazzers Helen Gross – voc; Louis Metcalf - tpt; <i>Cliff Jackson</i> – pno	New York,	Jul. 11-24, 1924
31633 If You Can't Ride Slow And Easy	Ajax 17077,	Document DOCD-5477

This is the same trumpet as before, thus Louis Metcalf. I cannot find any undeniable elements of Cliff Jackson's piano playing which is marked by his very strong rhythm and his frequent changing of the meter. Yet, after repeated listening and comparing this player's style to that of the suddenly surfaced name of Mike Jackson, Cliff might in fact be the pianist, yet with a youthful style of his.

Notes:

- *Jazz Directory Vol. 4: not listed*
- RR 86-6: *acc by cnt & p.*
- W. Bryant, *Ajax Records: personnel per Hooper): Louis Metcalfe, c; Louis Hooper, p.*
- BGR*4: *Louis Metcalf, c; Cliff Jackson, p.*
- Rust*6: *Louis Metcalf, c; Cliff Jackson, p.*

007 JOSIE MILES Choo Choo Jazzers Josie Miles – voc; Louis Metcalf – tpt (1); <i>Bob Fuller</i> – clt (2); <i>Cliff Jackson</i> – pno; unknown – train effects	New York,	Jul. 11-24, 1924
31641 Lovin' Henry Blues	Ajax 17057,	Document DOCD-5466
31644 Freight Train Blues	Ajax 17057,	Document DOCD-5466

Oh yes, Louis Metcalf! And this is the same player as on sessions 010-1, 011, 012, 013, 013-1 of my Choo Choo Jazzers list. The piano playing does not show Cliff Jackson's characteristics as heard later and might well be by a youthful and not yet developed Cliff Jackson. Jackson's playing in fast tempo as in 'Lovin' Henry Blues' in the instrumental strain between vocal choruses should sound different – his left hand! – from that heard here. As comparison, please, listen to Martha Copelands 'Black Snake Blues' and 'Papa If You Can't Do Better'! Cliff Jackson is named in Bastin p. 34: this definitely is Cliff Jackson, although 2 years later. On the other hand it does not show Mike Jackson's flowery right hand treble phrases nor Hooper's rather simple chordal playing in the left hand. So, I'd opt for Cliff Jackson here respecting the distinct essential and strong accompaniment.

Is this really Bob Fuller?

Notes:

- RR 77-6: *not listed*
- W. Bryant, *Ajax Records: no personnel per Hooper.*
- BGR*4: *Louis Metcalf, c (1); or Bob Fuller, cl (2); Cliff Jackson, p.*
- Rust*6: *Louis Metcalf, c; or Bob Fuller, cl; Cliff Jackson, p.*

008 HELEN GROSS Choo Choo Jazzers Helen Gross – voc; Louis Metcalf - tpt; <i>Mike Jackson</i> – pno; unknown male voice - speech	New York,	Aug. 16-27, 1924
31649 Ticket Agent, Ease Your Window Down	Ajax 17060,	Document DOCD-5477

This probably is the same trumpet as before on 010-1, 011, 012, 013 of my Choo Choo Jazzers list, thus Louis Metcalf. But individual traces are not as easy to recognize as before. In my ears this definitely is not Cliff Jackson on piano. Instead, I found a remark in W. Bryant, Ajax Records, for Ajax 17060 that Mike Jackson is supposed to be the pianist. This statement is listed as "per Hooper". In this publication this remark is attributed to the flip-side of this recording, thus Rosa Henderson's 'Hard-Hearted Hammah', but is said to be wrongly placed and should belong to 'Ticket Agent, Ease Your Window Down'. The pianist heard here likes to double the beat with his right hand while playing on-the-beat chordal four/four rhythm with his left hand. He shows a tendency to play melodic strains in a slight sixth/eighth phrasing.

Rust*6 lists this title under Ajax 17050!

Notes:

- *Jazz Directory Vol. 4: not listed*
- *RR 86-6: Louis Metcalf, cnt; prob Cliff Jackson, pno.*
- *W. Bryant, Ajax Records: no personnel per Hooper*
- *BGR*4: Louis Metcalf, c; Cliff Jackson, p; unknown male speech*
- *Rust*6: Louis Metcalf, c; Cliff Jackson, p. (as personnel for session. But after the title 'Ticket Agent ...' Rust shows - cBM, meaning that Bubber Miley would be playing)*

009	MAMIE SMITH the Choo Choo Jazzers	New York,	Aug. 16-27, 1924
	Mamie Smith – voc;		
	Louis Metcalf – tpt (2); unknown – pno		
31656	My Sweet Man (Tickles The Ivories For Me)	Ajax 17068,	Doc DOCD 5360
31658	What You Need Is Me (And What I Need Is You)	Ajax 17068,	Doc DOCD 5360

Mamie Smith has obviously listened to Bessie Smith records! Here Metcalf again shows his special squeezed tone. In late 1924 he worked as trumpet player with the house band of the Rhythm Club in Harlem, together with Sidney Bechet – later Johnny Hodges -, Willie The Lion Smith and Tommy Benford. Unfortunately, he was unable to recall his earliest recordings in his interview in RR 46. But he assumed his first recording being made in the fall of 1924. And he did remember that he waxed many recordings behind blues singers from the Joe Davis stable. So, his identification here might have been aurally.

As this piano player here certainly is very different from the pianist on the following session I tend to leave him unknown, because of Hooper's statement that he recorded only once (?) with Mamie Smith. Hooper's style is looser than this man's here who seems to belong to the Harlem piano school. This is a very heavy player whose identity I am unable to name.

DB: RR 46 promises a future survey of Metcalf's recordings. Can't see that it ever materialised? Metcalf was a standard Rust gap filler. Can't find any contemporary Metcalf with which to compare. Is there any? Can't relate this so well with the later Metcalf I know. The playing here is East Coast stiff but I hear some small Louis input by now – attempted Louis input. Metcalf stresses the ubiquitousness of Dunn. Was not Metcalf a better technician? I can revisit this if I can find some comparisons. From where do we have Hooper? (from Rust. KBR)

Notes:

- *RR 077 Louis Hooper: "If I made a record with Mamie Smith it was not more than one date. I can recall a rehearsal ... I believe Bob (Fuller) had played for her before. One session is all I can remember."*
- *W. Bryant, Ajax Records: no personnel per Hooper*
- *Rust*3: Louis Hooper – p; ? Louis Metcalf – c (second title)*
- *Rust*6: Louis Hooper – p; Louis Metcalf – c (second title)*
- *BGR*4: Louis Metcalf – cnt (2); Louis Hooper – pno*

010	ROSA HENDERSON the Choo Choo Jazzers	New York,	Aug. 16-27, 1924
	Rosa Henderson – voc;		
	Louis Metcalf – tpt;		
	<i>Cliff Jackson</i> – pno; Joe Davis - effects		
31675	Twelfth Street Blues	Ajax 17081,	Document DOCD-5403
31677	Memphis Bound	PA 032122,	Document DOCD-5403
31678	Memphis Bound	Ajax 17069,	Document DOCD-5403

I hear Metcalf with his mushy tone, his off-time phrasing with little Dunn influence, yet some Bubber Miley derived triplet effects, but he is not as rhythmically straight as Miley is. We hear a real stride piano player, and he might be Cliff Jackson. Yet, I do not hear Jackson's typical shifting of the meter, which is my criterion to identify him. A good and understandable description of Jackson's very personal stride style will be found in the booklet to Jazz Oracle BDW 8037 'Cliff Jackson and his Crazy Kats'. But on the strength of the very strong rhythmic playing this might be Cliff Jackson as listed.

Notes:

- *RR 86-6: not listed*
- *W. Bryant, Ajax Records: no personnel per Hooper*
- *BGR*2,*3,*4: Louis Metcalf, c; Cliff Jackson, p, Joe davis, train-whistle.*
- *Rust*3,*4: Louis Metcalf, c; Cliff Jackson, p, Joe Davis, train-whistle.*
- *Rust*6: Louis Metcalf, c; Cliff Jackson, p, Joe davis, train-whistle.*

Notable differences of takes:

- 31677: Trumpet introduction bars 3/4: Metcalf plays all through bar 3 and pauses on beat 3 in bar 4
 31678: Trumpet introduction bars 3/4: Metcalf is inattentive and pauses on beats 2-3 in bar 3 and 1-2 in bar 4

011	JOSIE MILES Choo Choo Jazzers	New York,	Sep. 18-22, 1924
	Josie Miles – voc;		
	Louis Metcalf – tpt; Bob Fuller – clt;		
	unknown – pno		
31690	Believe Me, Hot Mama	Ajax 17066,	Document DOCD-5467

It's Metcalf on trumpet and probably Fuller on clarinet. This probably is not Cliff Jackson on piano, but probably the unknown piano player of matrix 31679 (Josie Miles).

Notes:

- RR 86-6: not listed
- W. Bryant, Ajax Records: no personnel per Hooper
- BGR*4: unknown, c; unknown, cl; unknown, p; Elmer Snowden, bj.
- Rust*6: Louis Metcalf, c; Bob Fuller, cl; Cliff Jackson, p

012 SUSIE SMITH Choo Choo Jazzers	New York,	Sep. 18-22, 1924
Monette Moore – voc;		
<i>Louis Metcalf</i> – tpt; (<i>Herb Gregory?</i>) – tbn;		
Louis Hooper – pno; Joe Davis – effects		
31692	Workhouse Blues	Ajax 17064, Document DOCD-5338
31694	House Rent Blues	Ajax 17064, Document DOCD-5338
31695	House Rent Blues	Ajax 17064, Document DOCD-5338

The Rust and BGR personnel has been seen as correct, and has been found as such a couple of years ago when collating my Jake Frazier discographic. But in the meantime – with a better experience and insight into the trumpet styles of the time – I certainly hear Louis Metcalf with some characteristic phrases, time, tone, and vibrato.

Here now, we hear a trombone player in the legato style of Charlie Irvis, Miley's band mate and blowing partner of the early Ellington band. Only, that he lacks some important ingredients of Irvis' most individual style. The obvious differences between Irvis and this player can also be found on a couple of other band accompaniments in 1924. Since this player appears together with Rex Stewart – mostly assumed to be Bubber Miley in the discos – for some months, I can only deduce that this must have been Herb Gregory, Stewart's blowing partner and also member of John Montague's band. (Trumpet – trombone partnerships were very fashionable in Harlem at this time!) As we do not know any documented appearances of Gregory on records, this can only be my own personal assumption and has to be seen as a hypothesis. But I insist that this musician is neither Frazier nor Irvis!

Notes:

- RR 77-6, 77-6: Miley, Frazier, Hooper
- W. Bryant, Ajax Records: personnel per Hooper: Bubber Miley, cornet; Jake Frazier, trombone; Louis Hooper, piano; effects reputedly by Joe Davis.
- BGR*4: Bubber Miley, c; Jake Frazier, tb; Louis Hooper, p; Joe Davis, effects
- Rust*6: Bubber Miley, c; Jake Frazier, tb; Louis Hooper, p; Joe Davis, effects
- Scherman, Eriksson, Anderby, Wallen, B. Miley Discography: Bubber Miley (tp), Jake Frazier, (tb); Louis Hooper, (p); Joe Davis (effects).

Notable differences of takes:

- 31694: last four notes of tpt at the titles end: G – Ab – Bb - G
 31695: last four notes of tpt at the titles end: Bb – C – Bb - Db

013 CLEMENTINE SMITH Kansas City Five	New York,	c. Nov. 24, 1924
<i>Clementine Smith</i> - voc, kazoo;		
<i>Harry Smith</i> – cnt; unknown – tbn; unknown – clt;		
unknown – pno; unknown – bjo		
5740-5	Everybody Loves My Baby	Re 9760, Document DOCD-5518
5740-6	Everybody Loves My Baby	Ban 1464 not on LP/CD

I have a feeling that this session features the same – or some of – the musicians of the foregoing Edison session(s). The trumpet at times sounds like Miley but is not brilliant enough to be Miley, Metcalf or Dunn, and is too much in the Dunn mould to be Morris. After finding out about Harry Smith in the immediate past I am now convinced that this is our trumpet player here!

There certainly is a trombone very clearly heard, but because of too little exposition not to be identified. He plays some sort of tailgate style without the glissandos and delivers bass notes only after the introduction. The clarinet player shows similarities to the legato player of the Edisons before. He definitely is not Fuller. The pianist plays a two-fisted piano accompaniment unheard of from Hooper. The banjo player lacks Snowden's exuberance and plays functional only. Most interesting: this seems to be the first recording ever of kissing noises on '... Baby'!

The whole performance seems to be modelled after Clarence Williams' Blue Five recordings. So - as in the foregoing session(s) – I hear a band of more "Western" style.

Notes:

- BGR*4: prob Louis Metcalf or poss Bubber Miley, c; Bob Fuller, cl; Louis Hooper, p; Elmer Snowden, bj; unknown kazoo
- Rust*6: Louis Metcalf or Bubber Miley, c; Bob Fuller, cl; Louis Hooper, p; Elmer Snowden, bj.

Notes:

- BGR*4: prob Louis Metcalf or poss Bubber Miley, c; Bob Fuller, cl; Louis Hooper, p; Elmer Snowden, bj; unknown kazoo
- Rust*6: Louis Metcalf or Bubber Miley, c; Bob Fuller, cl; Louis Hooper, p; Elmer Snowden, bj.
- Scherman, Eriksson, Anderby, Wallen, Bubber Miley Discography: Bubber Miley (tp), unknown (tb); Bob Fuller (cl), Louis Hooper (p), Elmer Snowden (bj). "Previous discographies have erroneously omitted the trombone player and the kazoo."

Notable differences of takes:

- 5740: As only take -5 of this title has been reissued, differences can not be determined.

014 JOSIE MILES AND JAZZ CASPER	New York,	c. Nov. 24, 1924
<i>Josie Miles, Jazz Caspar</i> (Billy Higgins) – voc duet;		
<i>Harry Smith</i> – tpt;		
unknown – pno; unknown – bjo		
5741-1	Let's Agree To Disagree	Ban 1499 on LP/CD ?
5741-2	Let's Agree To Disagree	Ban 1499 on LP/CD ?
Note: one of the takes listed has been issued on Document DOCD-5403		

This seems to be the same Miley disciple as before, but not Miley himself - nor Metcalf. And I do not think to hear Hooper and Snowden here. The Plaza people apparently have engaged people different from the Ajax stable, not to talk of the Edison men. Yet, the Miley influence is there – and probably wanted. And there is a slight similarity to Hooper, but not to Snowden.

As before I am convinced of Harry Smith's presence.

Notes:

- BGR*4: *poss Bubber Miley or prob Louis Metcalf, c; Louis Hooper, p; Elmer Snowden, bj*

- Rust*6: *Bubber Miley or Louis Metcalf, c; Louis Hooper, p; Elmer Snowden, bj.*

- Scherman, Eriksson, Anderby, Wallen, *Bubber Miley Discography: Bubber Miley (tp), Louis Hooper (p), Elmer Snowden (bj).* "It is not known which takes appear on which issues." <

Notable differences of takes:

5741: *As only one take of this title has been reissued, differences can not be determined.*

015 **CLEMENTINE SMITH - BILLY HIGGINS** *the Kansas City Five* New York, c. Nov. 24, 1924
 Clementine Smith - voc, kazoo; Billy Higgins - voc;
 Harry Smith - tpt;
 unknown - pno; unknown - bjo
 5742-1 *I'm Done Done Done With You* Ban 1483, Document DOCD T-009
 5742-3 *I'm Done Done Done With You* Ban 1483, Document DOCD-5518

Once again, there is the trumpet player sounding a bit like Miley, but in my opinion a definitely different man following Miley's model, Harry Smith. No trombone and no clarinet on this recording. BGR and Rust are obviously wrong in listing a full band for this title!

Notes:

- BGR*4: *prob Louis Metcalf or poss Bubber Miley, c; Bob Fuller, cl; Louis Hooper, p; Elmer Snowden, bj; unknown kazoo*

- Rust*6: *Louis Metcalf or Bubber Miley, c; Bob Fuller, cl; Louis Hooper, p; Elmer Snowden, bj.*

- Scherman, Eriksson, Anderby, Wallen, *Bubber Miley Discography: Bubber Miley (tp), Bob Fuller (cl), Louis Hooper (p), Elmer Snowden (bj).* "For all three Clementine Smith, Josie Miles and Billie Higgins titles above, Dixon-Godrich have *poss B. Miley or prob Louis Metcalf, Rust has Miley or Metcalf. We believe it is definitely Miley on aural evidence.*"

Notable differences of takes:

5742-1: *Tune starts with 19 seconds of spoken dialogue, 2 bars cnt vamp, followed by vocal*

5742-3: *Tune starts with 8 bars cnt intro, 2 bars cnt vamp, followed by vocal*

016 **SIX BLACK DIAMONDS** New York, c. Dec. 02, 1924
 Louis Metcalf - tpt; Jake Frazier - tbn; (Bob Fuller) - clt, sop;
 Louis Hooper - pno; Elmer Snowden - bjo
 5758-1 Those Panama Mamas Ban 1456 on LP/CD ?
 5758-2 Those Panama Mamas Ban 1456 on LP/CD ?
 5758-3 Those Panama Mamas Ban 1456 on LP/CD ?

The trumpet player certainly is not Miley, but most probably Louis Metcalf instead (there is only one trumpet player present). This is not Miley's style. I also see the slight possibility of Rex Stewart here. Jake Frazier undisputed. Bob Fuller - if this is he - plays clarinet and soprano sax, not alto as given in Rust. Hooper and Snowden undisputed.

Notes:

- Rust*2: *Bubber Miley (cnt); Jake Frazier (tbn); Bob Fuller (clt, alt); Louis Hooper (pno); Buddy Christian (bjo)*

- Rust*3, *4, *6: *Bubber Miley, ? Louis Metcalf, c; Jake Frazier, tb; Bob Fuller, cl, as; Louis Hooper, p; Elmer Snowden, bj.*

Notable differences of takes:

5758: *One of the takes listed has been reissued on Jazz Archives (F) No.131 159252 and on VJM VLP 20 (LP), but it is not known which one.*

017 **CLEMENTINE SMITH** *the Kansas City Five* New York, c. Dec. 02, 1924
 Clementine Smith - voc;
 Louis Metcalf - tpt; Jake Frazier - tbn; (Bob Fuller) - clt, sop;
 Louis Hooper - pno; Elmer Snowden - bjo
 5759-2 Nobody Knows What A Red Head Mama Can Do Ban 1479, Document DOCD-5518
 5760-1 Big Bad Bill Is Sweet William Now Ban 1464 not on LP/CD
 5760-2 Big Bad Bill Is Sweet William Now Ban 1464, Document DOCD-5518

These two Plaza sessions certainly belong together (consecutive matrices) and have identical personnel. Insofar everything said about the Six Black Diamonds also applies to this session. Again, Fuller doubles on soprano sax, not on alto!

Notes:

- BGR*4: *prob Louis Metcalf or poss Bubber Miley, c; prob Jake Frazier, tb; Bob Fuller, cl, as; Louis Hooper, p; Elmer Snowden, bj.*

- Rust*3, *4: *?Louis Metcalf or ?Bubber Miley -c; ?Jake Frazier -tb; Bob Fuller -cl -as; Louis Hooper -p; Elmer Snowden -bj.*

- Rust*6: *Louis Metcalf or Bubber Miley, c; Jake Frazier, tb; Bob Fuller, cl, as; Louis Hooper, p; Elmer Snowden, bj.*

Notable differences of takes:

5760: *As only take -2 of this title has been reissued, differences can not be determined.*

018 **NETTIE POTTER** New York, c. Dec. 15, 1924
 Nettie Potter - voc;
 Louis Metcalf - tpt; Jake Frazier - tbn (1); Bob Fuller - clt (2,3);
 Louis Hooper - pno
 5786-1 A Good Man Is Hard To Find Ban 1483, Document DOCD-5516
 5787-1 Blind Man Blues Re 9781, Document DOCD-5516
 5787-2 Blind Man Blues Ban 1484, Document DOCD-5516

I hear much worse acoustics than on the Plaza sessions as before. But Louis Metcalf seems clear. The trombonist only plays very sparsely (introduction and last bar of the first tune) but can be identified with some probability as Jake Frazier. On the second title (two takes) we hear Bob Fuller, perhaps subbing for an intoxicated Frazier?

Louis Hooper shows some hitherto unheard oom-pah rhythm in the fast part of the first title, but this only with both hands, thus showing that he definitely was not a stride pianist.

Notes:

- BGR*2,*3,*4: prob Bubber Miley or poss Louis Metcalf, c; prob Jake Frazier, tb; Bob Fuller, cl, as; Louis Hooper, p.
- Rust*3,*4,*6: Louis Metcalf or Bubber Miley, c; Jake Frazier, tb(1); Bob Fuller, cl(2,3); Louis Hooper, p.

Notable differences of takes:

5787-1: Introduction: bar 4 beats 3-4: Fuller plays 4 eighth-notes f-ab-f-db and 1 quarter-note bb
5787-2: Introduction: bar 4 beats 3-4: Fuller plays eighth-triplet ab-bb-ab, 4 eighth-notes f-db-f-db

019 BOOKER'S JAZZ BAND

New York, c. Dec. 15, 1924

Louis Metcalf – tpt; Jake Frazier – tbn;

Bob Fuller – clt; Charles Booker – alt;

Louis Hooper – pno; (Elmer Snowden) - bjo

5788-2 Hot Sax

Do 3439, IAJRC 12 (LP)

5789-1 West Texas Blues

Do 3474, IAJRC 12 (LP)

5789-2 West Texas Blues

Do 3474, IAJRC 12 (LP)

According to the consecutive matrix numbers this is the same session as before with Netti Potter.

Louis Metcalf, Jake Frazier, Bob Fuller and Louis Hooper seem clear. The two reedmen obviously both play alto sax in the second chorus of the first title (see VJM 137-7). The banjo sounds not as clear as of Snowden, and stylistically does not display Snowden's style on these sides, and I therefore doubt Snowden's presence here. It is thus a bit strange that these three sides have found their only reissue on an IAJRC LP devoted to Elmer Snowden's recordings. Or is it Snowden on banjo here, yet? On the LP cover Snowden remarks about this session: "I can't really remember these sides, but they sound strangely familiar. This was a session arranged by Joe Davis, whom I met in 1923 through Bubber. In fact, he arranged all of my records." Now, this sounds very dubious here, of the like of: *They told me I am on this record. So, they will probably know, although I do not remember it.*

Notes:

- Rust*2: unknown cnt, tbn, clt; Charles Booker (alt); unknown pno, bjo.

- Rust*3,*4: probably: Bubber Miley -c; Jake Frazier -tb; Bob Fuller -cl; Charles Booker -as; Louis Hooper -p; Elmer Snowden -bj.

- Rust*6: prob Bubber Miley, c; Jake Frazier, tb; Bob Fuller, cl; Charles Booker, as; Louis Hooper, p; Elmer Snowden, bj.

- Scherman, Eriksson, Anderby, Wallen, Bubber Miley Discography: Probably: Bubber Miley (tp), prob Jake Frazier, (tb); Bob Fuller (cl,as); Louis Hooper (p); Elmer Snowden (bj). "5789-1 was probably also used on one or both of the 78rpm issues, but we have no information about it. The above personnel is listed in Rust, and we agree, although the trombone playing is somewhat uncharacteristic for Frazier. The proximity of the matrix numbers indicates that these titles were probably recorded at the same session as the Nettie Potter titles above. (Rut has unspecified December, 1924 for Booker)."

- VJM 176, B. Hitchens, Choo Choo Jazzers: prob Bubber Miley (t); Jake Frazier (tb); Bob Fuller (cl, as); Charles Booker (as); Louis Hooper (p), poss Elmer Snowden (bj). "Presumably same session as above. Bj less prominent than most E. Snowdens."

Notable differences of takes:

5789-1: Trumpet starts the penultimate chorus with: 1 eighth-note g, 1 half-note bb, 1 quarter-note c, 2 eighth-notes eb-c, 1 quarter-note eb

5789-2: Trumpet starts the penultimate chorus with: 4 eighth-notes gb-g-bb-c, 1 quarter-note bb, 1 half-note eb

020 COTTON CLUB ORCHESTRA

New York, Jan. 06, 1925

Louis Metcalf, R.Q. Dickerson – tpt; De Priest Wheeler – tbn;

Dave Jones, Eli Logan – alt; Andrew Brown – ten, clt;

Andy Preer – vln;

Earres Prince – pno; Charlie Stamps – bjo; Jimmy Smith – bbs; LeRoy Maxey – dms

140224-1 Down And Out Blues

Col 287-D, Frog DGF 32

140225-1 Snag 'Em Blues

Col 287-D, Frog DGF 32

I hear Louis Metcalf playing trumpet lead in the band on both titles. He also plays the first tpt solo on 'Snag 'Em Blues', the second being played muted by R.Q. Dickerson. The 8 bar tpt solo (also muted) in 'Down And Out Blues' is also played by Dickerson. So, Metcalf's position in the band was lead (first) trumpet, just like in the Ellington band later on.

Notes:

- Carey, McCarthy, Jazz Directory Vol. Two: R.Q. Dickerson, Harry Cooper (tpt); DePriest Wheeler (tbn); Dave Jones, Eli Logan (alt);

Andrew Brown (ten); E. Prince (p); Charley Stamps (bj); Jimmy Smith (bs); LeRoy Maxey (dms).

- Rust*2: R.Q. Dickerson, Louis Metcalf (tpt); DePriest Wheeler (tbn); Dave Jones, Eli Logan (alt); Andrew Brown (ten); Eddie Prince (pno); Charley Stamps (bjo); Jimmy Smith (bbs); LeRoy Maxey (dms); Andy Preer (leader and vln when used).

- Rust*3: R.Q. Dickerson, Louis Metcalf -t; DePriest Wheeler -tb; Dave Jones, Eli Logan -as; Andrew Brown -cl -ts; Earres Prince -p; Charley Stamps -bj; Jimmy Smith -bb; LeRoy Maxey -d; Andy Preer -ldr and vn when used

- Rust*4: Andy Preer -vn (when used), dir. R.Q. Dickerson, Louis Metcalf -t; DePriest Wheeler -tb; Dave Jones, Eli Logan -as; Andrew Brown -cl -ts; Earres Prince -p; Charley Stamps -bj; Jimmy Smith -bb; LeRoy Maxey -d.

- Rust*6: Andy Preer -vn (when used), dir. R.Q. Dickerson, Louis Metcalf -t; DePriest Wheeler -tb; Dave Jones, ?Walter Thomas -as -bar; Andrew Brown -cl -ts; Earres Prince -p; Charley Stamps -bj; Jimmy Smith -bb; LeRoy Maxey -d. Note: Eli Logan, previously cited as 2nd alto sax, reportedly died in July, 1924; hence the postulate of Thomas.)

- Storyville 1996/6-202: "Eli Logan, member of Dickerson's Cotton Club Orchestra, died in the Booker Washington sanatorium, NYC, after a brief illness on 6 June." (CD 13/6/25 7/7)! 1925! He may thus still have been present at the first three Cotton Club Orchestra recording sessions!

021 ROSA HENDERSON the Kansas City Four

New York, Feb. 19-Mar. 16, 1925

Rosa Henderson – voc;

Louis Metcalf - tpt; Bob Fuller – clt;

Louis Hooper – pno; Elmer Snowden - bjo

31790 Everything My Sweetie Does Pleases Me

Ajax 17116, Document DOCD-5403

I hear Metcalf with his very typical tone, vibrato and time. Fuller, Hooper and Snowden certainly play their usual stuff.

Notes:

- RR 77-6: not listed
- W. Bryant, Ajax Records: no personnel per Hooper
- BGR*4: unknown c; prob Bob Fuller, cl; prob Louis Hooper, p; prob Elmer Snowden, bj.
- Rust*3: Presumably the Kansas City Five with one absentee: (?Bubber Miley -c; Bob Fuller -cl; Louis Hooper -p; Elmer Snowden -bj).
- Rust*6: Louis Metcalf, c; Bob Fuller, cl; Louis Hooper, p; Elmer Snowden, bj.

022 **KANSAS CITY FOUR**

New York, Feb. 19-Mar. 16, 1925

Rex Stewart – cnt; Jake Frazier – tbn; Bob Fuller – clt, alt;

Louis Hooper – pno; Elmer Snowden – bjo

31827 Dark Gal Blues

Ajax 17128, Jazz Archives No.131 159252

31831 Get It Fixed

Ajax 17128, Jazz Archives No.131 159252

I certainly hear Rex Stewart – not Metcalf as with Rust*6 – together with the usual participants as given.

Notes:

- Jazz Directory Vol. 5: Bubber Miley (cnt); Jake Frazier (tbn); Bob Fuller (clt); unknown p; bj..
- RR 77-6: Rex Stewart, Jake Frazier, Bob Fuller, Louis Hooper, Elmer Snowden.
- W. Bryant, Ajax Records: personnel per Hooper: Rex Stewart, cornet; Jake Frazier, trombone; Bob Fuller, clarinet; Louis Hooper, piano; Elmer Snowden, banjo .
- Rust*2: Bubber Miley (cnt); Jake Frazier (tbn); Bob Fuller (clt); Louis Hooper, Arthur Ray or Mike Jackson (pno); Buddy Christian (bjo).
- Rust*3,*4,*6: Louis Metcalf, c; Jake Frazier, tb; Bob Fuller, cl; Louis Hooper, p; Elmer Snowden, bj.

023 **SARA MARTIN** Harry's Happy Four

New York, Nov. 24, 1925

Sara Martin – voc;

Harry Cooper, Louis Metcalf – tpt;

Earres Prince – pno; Elmer Snowden – bjo

73778-B Some Of These Mornings

OK 8292, Document DOCD-5398

73779-B Yes, Sir, That's My Baby

OK 8252, Document DOCD-5398

73780-B Alabamy Bound

OK 8252, Document DOCD-5398

We have Harry's Happy Four accompanying Sara Martin here. As for the band everything is as at their first session. Only that R.Q. Dickerson is replaced by his successor in the Cotton Club Orchestra, Louis Metcalf. And again, Cooper leaves solo honours to his trumpet partner, he himself restraining with the first trumpet parts. This can clearly be recognized in 'Yes, Sir' chorus B2, where Cooper plays the melody and Metcalf ad-libs above Cooper in an improvised upper (third) part. Different to Bernard Addison's noted presence on these sides he very probably is not the banjo player here. Chris Hillman's notes to the fabulous Collectors Items 006 LP tell us that Addison denied his participation in these sides. As some of the present musicians were working with Elmer Snowden at this time, Snowden may well be the banjo player with his busy and multi-chorded banjo style. I had associated this with Addison earlier on, as he shows similar ones on the Seminole Syncopators sides, anticipating his later solo capabilities.

Notes:

- BGR*2,*3,*4: Harry Cooper, Louis Metcalf, cnts; Earres Prince, pno; Bernard Addison, bjo.
- Rust*3,*4,*6: Harry Cooper, Louis Metcalf, c; Earres Prince, p; Bernard Addison, bj.
- Collectors Items 006 LP cover-text: "By the time the recordings with Metcalf were made Cooper had left the Cotton Club Orchestra; both he and Metcalf were associated with Elmer Snowden around this time and it is possible that Snowden plays banjo on the records, though Cooper's erstwhile colleague Bernard Addison has been suggested he denies participation).

Tune Structures:

73778-B *Some Of These Mornings* Key of Eb OKeh
 (Intro 4 bars ens)(A1 Chorus 16 bars AABA ens – middle breaks LM)(B Verse 8 bars voc + ens)(A2 Chorus 16 bars voc + ens)(A3 Chorus 16 bars voc + ens)(A4 Chorus 16 bars voc + ens)(A5 Chorus 16 bars voc + ens riff)(A6 Chorus 16 bars ens – middle breaks LM)

73779-B *Yes, Sir, That's My Baby* Key of C OKeh
 (Intro 8 bars ens)(A Verse 16 bars AB voc + ens)(B1 Chorus 32 bars AABA voc + ens)(B2 Chorus 32 bars ens LM soloing above HC)(B3 Chorus 32 bars voc + ens)

73780-B *Alabamy Bound* Key of Eb (Cm) OKeh
 (Intro 8 bars ens)(A Verse 32 bars AABA voc + ens)(B1 Chorus 32 bars AA' voc + ens)(C Interplay 32 bars AA')(B2 Chorus 32 bars voc + ens)

024 **HARRY'S HAPPY FOUR**

New York, Dec. 01, 1925

Harry Cooper, Louis Metcalf – tpt;

Earres Prince – pno; Elmer Snowden – bjo;

73800-A Western Melody

OK 8266, Frog DGF 69

73801-B Blue, That's All

OK 8266, Frog DGF 69

LP as well as CD play the key of B natural for the first title and A natural for the second. As this is most uncommon for brass instrument playing in jazz (except perhaps for the Henderson band), these keys have to be seen as the result of wrong speed of the turntable. I decided for C for the first title and Bb for the second. The alternative would be Bb for the first title and consequently Ab for the second, but the brilliant sound of the trumpets seems to indicate the higher keys.

Again, we hear Harry Cooper playing first trumpet parts and leaving solos to Louis Metcalf. In harmony Metcalf plays a second part frequently changing to a third – upper – part. The banjo player is much busier than Charlie Stamps in the first Harry's Happy Four session and might therefore be Elmer Snowden, contrary to Bernard Addison's assumed presence earlier on (see above).

Notes:

- Jazz Directory Vol. 2: Harry Cooper, unknown (tpt); unknown (p); Bernard Addison (bj)
- Rust*2,*3,*4,*6: Harry Cooper, Louis Metcalf, c; Earres Prince, p; Bernard Addison may replace Charlie Stamps, bj.

Titles:

73800-A *Western Melody* Key of C (or Bb) OKeh
 (Intro 4 bars pno)(Chorus 1 12 bars Blues tpts in harmony)(Chorus 2 12 bars tpts in harmony)(Bridge 4 bars pno)(Chorus 3 12 bars tpt muted LM)(Chorus 4 12 bars tpt muted LM)(Bridge 4 bars pno)(Chorus 5 12 bars tpts in harmony)(Coda 4 bars tpts in harmony)
 73801-B *Blue, That's All* Key of Bb (or Ab) OKeh
 (Intro 4 bars tpts in harmony)(Verse 16 bars tpts in harmony – middle break pno)((Chorus 1 20 bars AA'BA'A muted tpts in harmony)(Chorus 2 20 bars pno/bjo)(Chorus 3 20 bars tpt muted LM)(Chorus 4 20 bars tpts muted riff) (Chorus 5 20 bars tpts muted riff middle break pno)

025 **MAGGIE JONES** her Jazz Band New York, May 07, 1926
 Maggie Jones – voc;
 Louis Metcalf – tpt; Jake Frazier – tbn (1,2,3);
 Cliff Jackson – pno

142165-3	The Man I Love Is Oh So Good	Col 14243-D,	Document DOCD-5349
142166-2	I'm Leaving You	Col 14139-D,	Document DOCD-5349 ?
142166-3	I'm Leaving You	Col 14139-D,	Document DOCD-5349 ?
142167-1	I'm A Real Kind Mama	Col 14139-D,	Document DOCD-5349
142167-2	I'm A Real Kind Mama	Col 14139-D,	Document DOCD-5654
142168-2	You Ain't Gonna Feed In My Pasture Now	Col 14243-D,	Document DOCD-5349 ?
142168-3	You Ain't Gonna Feed In My Pasture Now	Col 14243-D,	Document DOCD-5349 ?

Note: one of each takes of matrices 142166 and 142168 have been issued on CD, but it is not known which! Unfortunately, the same applies to the earlier LP issue VJM VLP 25!

Oh yes, we are on firm ground here! What a blessing! Metcalf has become more classic now (see sessions 010 to 026). He is only half a year now from being engaged as first trumpet by Duke Ellington, and he certainly had fallen under the spell of Louis Armstrong. The squeezed, pressed and slurred notes are mainly gone now, and his playing is much more adulterated. Also, Jake Frazier has developed in the two years time of our investigation here. His playing has grown more melodic and softer, and less staccato.

Cliff Jackson is a very sensitive accompanist here, not "The Terror" playing hard and offensive stride.

My statements here contradict what I have said re the brass players on this session in my Jake Frazier investigation of some years back! I revoke!

Notes:

- Jazz Directory Vol. 5: Joe Smith (cnt); Charlie Green (tbn); Fletcher Henderson (pno).

- RR 77-9: not listed.

- BGR*4: Louis Metcalf, c; Jake Frazier, tb (1,2,3); Cliff Jackson, p.

- Rust*6: Louis Metcalf, c; Jake Frazier, tb (1,2,3); Cliff Jackson, p.

Discernible differences of takes (from KBR):

142167-1: last two tpt notes of 4-bar vamp (after intro): one-octave downward jump C - c

142167-2: last two tpt notes of 4-bar vamp (after intro): seventh upward jump D - c. (On CD this item plays B natural instead of C!)

026 **ROSA HENDERSON** Three Hot Eskimos New York, May 14, 1926
 Rosa Henderson – voc;
 Edwin Swayze – tpt; Bob Fuller – clt;
 Cliff Jackson – pno

E-3050	Here Comes My Baby	Voc 1021,	Document DOCD-5403
E-3052	Chicago Policeman Blues	Voc 1921,	Document DOCD-5404

A couple of relevant Harlem trumpet players of the time have been named by the discogs as you might see below. But in listening I became aware that not one of the listed players was present here. First, I suggested Louis Metcalf, following Rust. After comparing with earlier Metcalf sides I missed his dropping the tone at the end, and I opted for Rex Stewart. But further listening and Joerg Kuhfuss' objections against the fore mentioned players made me search for other trumpet players who might have recorded for Vocalion in June 1926. As a pleasant surprise I found Edwin Swayze (sic) who was touring in the East with the show Bamville Dandies at this time. Comparison brought strong similarities stylistically, and I am convinced now that this trumpet player here is Edwin "King" Swayze. (Compare the Sammie (sic) Lewis OK 8285 and Sammy Lewis' Bamville Syncopators recordings and The Levee Serenaders!) Swayze himself is remembered by colleagues as "a terrific trumpeter whose idol was King Oliver – not Louis as most of us were trying to sound like" (Arcadia 2008 cover text). For Swayze's correct name, see Storyville 78, p. 230.

Unfortunately, this result did not bear any hints as to the personality of the clarinet player with his very strong tone and rather hasty multi-toned phrasing. The way of playing made me think of a Caribbean musician as there were many of them living and playing in New York in these years, and I suggested Carmello Jari as a possibility. Also, the erratic Arville Harris came to my mind. But to my next pleasant surprise it dawned on me that I heard the not-so-well esteemed Bob Fuller, who obviously had completed a remarkable development at this date. Comparison with the Three Jolly Miner sides verified my assumption. (But then, Fuller's presence with the New Orleans Blue Five has to be sincerely doubted.)

Cliff Jackson on piano with his steam-roller stride is absolutely certain!

Notes:

- Delaunay: possibly: Joe Smith (c), Buster Bailey (cl), Fletcher Henderson (p)

- Jazz Directory Vol.4: unknown (cor); Jimmy O'Bryant (clt); unknown (pno).

- RR 77-8: not listed.

- BGR*2,*3: Tom Morris or Bubber Miley cnt; Bob Fuller, clt; prob Louis Hooper or poss Cliff Jackson, pno.

- BGR*4: unknown, c; Bob Fuller, cl; prob Louis Hooper or poss Cliff Jackson, p.

- Rust*3,*4,*6: Louis Metcalf, c; Bob Fuller, cl; Cliff Jackson or Edgar Dowell, p.

027 **ROSA HENDERSON** the Four Black Diamonds New York, Jun. 05, 1926
 Rosa Henderson – voc;
 Edwin Swayze – tpt; Oscar Hammond – tbn; Bob Fuller – clt;
 Cliff Jackson – pno

E-3189 / 90	<i>Hock Shop Blues</i>	<i>Voc unissued</i>	<i>not on LP/CD</i>
E-3191	<i>I'm Savin' It All For You</i>	<i>Voc unissued</i>	<i>not on LP/CD</i>
E-3194	<i>Daddy, Come Back</i>	<i>Voc 1025,</i>	<i>Document DOCD-5404</i>
E-3196	<i>I've Got Somebody Now</i>	<i>Voc 1025,</i>	<i>Document DOCD-5404</i>

Aurally, as with the last session above, I recognize Swayze again, as well as Bob Fuller on clarinet. The rather unprofessional playing of the trombonist accords well with what can be heard from Oscar Hammond, trombonist of the Sammy Lewis Bamville Syncopators. And I think that he is the player. (The Bamville Syncopators' personnel of the time you might find in the last Storyville magazine Nos. 78, p.229 and 162, p. 240, or in Franz Hoffmann's compilations of "Jazz Advertised".) And again, very beautiful, strong and distinct Cliff Jackson.

Notes:

- *Jazz Directory Vol.4: unknown personnel*
- *RR 77-9: not listed.*
- *Rust*3,*4: Louis Metcalf, c; Jake Frazier, tb; Bob Fuller, cl; Cliff Jackson, Louis Hooper or Edgar Dowell, p.*
- *BGR*2,*3: Louis Metcalf, cnt; Jake Frazier, tbn; Bob Fuller, clt; prob Louis Hooper or poss Cliff Jackson or Edgar Dowell, p.*
- *BGR*4: unknown, c; unknown,cl; unknown, p.*
- *Rust*6: Louis Metcalf, c; Jake Frazier, tb; Cliff Jackson, p. Louis Hooper may be the pianist.*

028	DUKE ELLINGTON AND HIS KENTUCKY CLUB ORCHESTRA	New York,	Nov. 29, 1926
029	VIOLA McCOY	New York,	c. Nov. 29, 1926
	<i>Viola McCoy – voc;</i>		
	<i>Bubber Miley – tpt; Cliff Jackson – pno</i>		
2219-C	<i>I'm Saving It All For You</i>	<i>Cam 1066,</i>	<i>Document DOCD-5417</i>
2220-B	<i>Papa, If You Can't Do Better (I'll Let A Better Man Move In)</i>	<i>Cam 1066,</i>	<i>Document DOCD-5417</i>

I do not think that this is Metcalf. This trumpet player plays simple rhythm straight on the beat and does not squeeze and bend his notes: so not Metcalf. Instead he sounds like Miley on a very bad day (late but strong Johnny Dunn influences, yet no growls), but might also be some Miley imitator as we had one on some sessions above. But with reference to the following Martha Copeland session where Miley is documented I name Miley with distinct certainty. As a comparison to Metcalf's playing, listen to session of December 28, 1926 (031) below. Bubber Miley in decline. The pianist certainly is not Hooper as claimed by himself in RR 77. This is distinct stride style playing and fits perfectly into Cliff Jackson's style (shifts of meter or "broken rhythm").

Notes:

- *RR 77-8: poss Louis Metcalf; Louis Hooper.*
- *BGR*2,*3,*4: Louis Metcalf, c; Cliff Jackson, p.*
- *Rust*3,*4,*6: Louis Metcalf, c; Cliff Jackson, p.*

030	VIOLA McCOY	New York,	c. Dec. 28, 1926
	<i>Viola McCoy – voc;</i>		
	<i>Louis Metcalf – tpt; Cliff Jackson – pno</i>		
2261-A	<i>"Git" Goin'</i>	<i>Cam 1097,</i>	<i>Document DOCD-5602</i>
2261-C	<i>"Git" Goin'</i>	<i>Cam 1097,</i>	<i>Document DOCD-5418</i>
2262-A	<i>Someday You'll Come Back To Me</i>	<i>Cam 1097,</i>	<i>Document DOCD-5418</i>
2262-B	<i>Someday You'll Come Back To Me</i>	<i>Cam 1097,</i>	<i>Document DOCD-5602</i>

These are beautiful examples of Metcalf's and Jackson's styles. This is great and mature individual jazz/blues accompaniment.

Notes:

- *RR 77-8: not listed.*
- *BGR*2,*3,*4: Louis Metcalf, c; Cliff Jackson, p.*
- *Rust*3,*4,*6: Louis Metcalf, c; Cliff Jackson, p.*

Notable differences of takes:

2261-A	<i>Trumpet seems to start with verse erroneously: 1 three-quarter-note eb, 3 quarter-notes bb-c-bb, 1 half-note f trumpet ends the 4-bar introduction with a sustained high half-note f on a piano dominant chord Bb7.</i>
2261-C	<i>Trumpet plays a clear 4-bar introduction, starting with 1 quarter-note eb, 1 eighth-note c, 1 quarter-note bb trumpet ends the 4-bar introduction with a descending phrase – ending on bb, leading to the tune's basic key Eb.</i>
2262-A	<i>Introduction: trumpet starts with 5 eighth-notes g-ab-a-bb - bb, 2 eight-triplets a-bb-a – ab-f-g, 1 quarter-note eb end of tune: final trumpet phrase: 3-toned downward jump 1 quarter-note middle bb, 2 eighth-notes low bb – low bb</i>
2262-B	<i>Introduction: trumpet starts with 5 eighth-notes g-bb-g-bb - d, 1 quarter-note d, 1 eighth-note bb, 1 half-note g end of tune: final trumpet phrase consists of 3 eighth-notes bb-gb-g, 1 quarter-note bb</i>

031	DUKE ELLINGTON AND HIS KENTUCKY CLUB ORCHESTRA	New York,	Dec. 29, 1926
032	DUKE ELLINGTON AND HIS KENTUCKY CLUB ORCHESTRA	New York,	Feb. 03, 1927
033	DUKE ELLINGTON AND HIS KENTUCKY CLUB ORCHESTRA	New York,	Feb. 28, 1927
034	DUKE ELLINGTON AND HIS KENTUCKY CLUB ORCHESTRA	New York,	Mar. 14, 1927
035	ORIGINAL JAZZ HOUNDS	New York,	Mar. 15, 1927

Jimmy Wade – cnt; Bill Dover – tbn; Arnett Nelson – clt;
James P. Johnson – pno; Stanley Wilson – bjo; Walter Wright – bbs; Edwin Jackson – dms;
Perry Bradford – voc

143657-2	<i>All That I Had Is Gone</i>	Col 14207-D,	Frog DGF 56
143658-3	<i>Lucy Long</i>	Col 14207-D,	Frog DGF 56

Recording two years after the preceding sessions Bradford used the same band name again. This time, there certainly is no connection to the personnel of 7-11 origin. Rust*6 still lists a personnel of: Louis Metcalf, cnt (!); Jake Frazier, tbn; Bob Fuller, clt; James P. Johnson, pno; unkn. bjo; ? Harry Hull, bbs; unkn. dms, chimes. This certainly – with the exception of James P. Johnson – is far off the mark.

Instead, as has been shown by Christopher Hillman in preceding years, these two titles seem to belong to a series of recordings made by musicians of the Jimmy Wade band of Chicago. The Jimmy Wade band, hailing from Chicago, had a long-time engagement at the Club Alabam in Harlem (June 1926 to April 1927) and used the opportunity to record under different leaderships and names (Georgia Strutters, P. Bradford Gang, Eva Taylor, poss. Okeh Melody Stars). Their trombonist W. Dover reportedly even subbed in the Fletcher Henderson band (poss. 19 November 1926).

Thus, we very certainly hear Jimmy Wade on trumpet and William Dover on trombone here.

This clarinet player plays with the same vibrato and a similar style as the man on the two preceding sessions. One of the reed men of the Wade band was Arnett Nelson at the time, and he seems to be responsible for the clarinet part (see Ch. Hillman, Chicago Swingers). As there is no report and no probability of Nelson being in New York his assumed presence on the Jazz Hounds sessions of August 1925 must be denied.

The banjo man and the drummer should accordingly be from the Wade band. The tuba man certainly is Walter Wright, compared to his playing on Perry Bradford's session of 16 February 1927. James P. Johnson is addressed namely by Bradford on the second title.

Thus, we have the same personnel here as on Perry Bradford and his Gang of Feb. 16, 1927!

Notes:

*Rust*2: Similar instrumentation; somewhat different personnel (to: Bubber Miley (cnt); Jimmy Harrison (?)(tbn); Herschel Brassfield (?) (clt, alt); Coleman Hawkins (ten); Leroy Tibbs ?)(pno); Gus Horsley or Samuel Speed (bjo); Perry Bradford (vcl.)) including James P. Johnson (pno); Bradford still the vocalist.*

*Rust*3,*4,*6: Louis Metcalf -c; Jake Frazier -tb; Bob Fuller -cl; James P. Johnson -p; unknown bj; ?Harry Hull -bb; unknown d-chimes; Perry Bradford -v.*

036	LIZZIE MILES	New York,	Mar. 18, 1927
	Lizzie Miles – voc;		
	Louis Metcalf – tpt; Louis Hooper – pno		
80644-B	Slow Up Papa	OK 8456,	Document DOCD-5459
80645-A	Grievin' Mama Blues	OK 8456,	Document DOCD-5459

In connection to the Martha Copeland session below below it is rather easy to find out this accompaniment here: Metcalf and Hooper. Only the piano (the instrument!) sounds very different!

Notes:

*- BGR*2,*3,*4: Louis Metcalf, c; Louis Hooper, p.*

*- Rust*3,*4,*6: Louis Metcalf, c; Louis Hooper, p.*

037	MARTHA COPELAND	New York,	Mar. 19, 1927
	Martha Copeland – voc;		
	Louis Metcalf – tpt; Louis Hooper – pno		
143689-1	Soul And Body	Col 14208-D,	Document DOCD-5372
143690-3	Sorrow Valley Blues	Col 14208-D,	Document DOCD-5372

And again, a printed documented accompaniment. Both players are easy to identify and their individual playing styles may serve to find out other “unknowns”. Metcalf is trying out whole-tone phrases here.

Notes:

*- BGR*2,*3,*4: Louis Metcalf, c; Louis Hooper, p.*

*- Rust*3,*4,*6: Louis Metcalf, c; Louis Hooper, p.*

038	DUKE ELLINGTON AND HIS WASHINGTONIANS	New York,	Mar. 22, 1927
-----	--	-----------	---------------

039	THE WASHINGTONIANS	New York,	Apr. 07, 1927
-----	---------------------------	-----------	---------------

040	THE WASHINGTONIANS	New York,	Apr. 30, 1927
-----	---------------------------	-----------	---------------

Louis Metcalf, June Clark – tpt; Joe Nanton – tbn;
 Otto Hardwick, Harry Carney – alt, clt; Rudy Jackson – ten, clt;
 Duke Ellington – pno; Fred Guy – bjo; *Mack Shaw* – bbs; Sonny Greer – dms;
 Rube Bloom – arr
 E-4965 / E-22809 Soliloquy

Br 3526, Chronological Classics 539

This is the Ellington band of the day, June Clark subbing for Bubber Miley. Miley is known for his alcohol abuse and his resulting unreliability. So this might have been one of the occasions that Ellington had to replace the erratic and unreliable Miley, another one being the session of Nov. 03, 1927, with Jabbo Smith substituting for Miley.

It is said that Ellington only once in his life fired a musician from his band, Miley, regardless of this musician's importance for the band. I assume that Metcalf played mainly first trumpet parts in the Ellington band, with Miley, as main soloist and crowd-puller, taking the second parts and being the get-off man. As there is only one title listed, there might have been others recorded on this day. (Can it be that other titles were rejected because of Miley's absence, and therefore the recordings being below Ellington's – or the company's - demands?)

The trumpet-soloist on this title is, to my ears, clearly Louis Metcalf, who also plays first trumpet part. So, June Clark is only heard dimly playing second trumpet part, which could have been played by any trumpet player of quality. This assumption is confirmed by a note in the Rosenberg/Williams drafts, that Clark played only section work here.

Notes:

*- Rust*3,*4,*6: June Clark, Louis Metcalf -c; Joe Nanton -tb; Otto Hardwick -ss -as -bar; ?Prince Robinson, ? another -cl -ts; Duke Ellington -p -a -ldr; Fred Guy -bj; Bass Edwards -bb; Sonny Greer -d; Rube Bloom -a.*

Title:

Soliloquy *Key of F* *Arr. by Bube Bloom (?W. Boutelje ?)* *Brunswick, Vocalion*
 (Intro 4 bars ens)(A1 Chorus 30 bars AA'B tpt LM 10 bars, ens 8 bars, tbn JN 4 bars, ens 8 bars)(B1 Chorus 18 bars AA' ens)(Bridge 4 bars ens)(C1 Verse 16 bars pno DE)(C2 Verse 16 bars ens)(A2 Chorus 30 bars ens)(Coda 4 bars ens)

041 **BUTTERBEANS & SUSIE** Eddie Heywood's Jazz Trio New York, May 06, 1927
 Joe and Susie Edwards – voc duet;
 Louis Metcalf – tpt; Bob Fuller – alt;
 Eddie Heywood – pno

81063-B	You're A No 'Count Triflin' Man	OK 8502,	Document DOCD-5545
81064-C	Mama's Gonna Shorten Your Days	OK uniss. on 78,	Document DOCD-5545
81065-A	Gonny Make You Sorry (For Everything You Do)	OK 8556,	Document DOCD-5545

Beautiful, active and agile Metcalf, very assured and with all his characteristics, much drive and a flexible tone. And an extraordinarily retained Bob Fuller, playing a 14-bars solo in 'Mama's Gonna Shorten ...' which shows all his antiquated features, but fallen out of time here.

Notes:

- Rust*3,*4: Louis Metcalf -c; Eddie Heywood -p.
- Rust*6: Louis Metcalf, c; Bob Fuller, as; Eddie Heywood, p.
- BGR*2: Louis Metcalf, cnt; unknown, alt; Eddie Heywood, pno.
- BGR*3,*4: Louis Metcalf, c; unknown -as; Eddie Heywood, p.
- Storyville 1998-9, Laurie Wright, Bob Fuller: "I talked with Louis Metcalf about some of his recordings and when I asked him about the sides with Butterbeans and Susie which had an unidentified alto sax player he immediately replied, "That would be Bob Fuller."

042 **VIOLA McCOY** New York, c. Jun. 07, 1927
 Viola McCoy – voc;
 Louis Metcalf – tpt; Louis Hooper – pno

2495-B	Back Water Blues	Cam 1189,	Document DOCD-5418
2496-A	Mama Is Waitin' For You	Cam 1189,	Document DOCD-5418

This trumpet player is a first-class player and shows those squeezed tones we are accustomed from Louis Metcalf. He is in another class than the assumed Horace Holmes in BGR and Rust. For me he is definitely Metcalf. The pianist is very probably Louis Hooper.

Notes:

- Record Research #77-8: unknown cornet, Louis Hooper.
- BGR*2,*3,*4: prob Horace Holmes, c; Louis Hooper, p.
- Rust*3,*4,*6: ? Horace Holmes, c; Louis Hooper, p.

043 **JOHNSON'S JAZZERS** New York, Sep. 02, 1927
 Louis Metcalf – tpt; James P. Johnson – pno;
 Perry Bradford – voc

144621-2	Skiddle-De-Scow	Col 14247-D,	Chronological Classics 658
144622-2	Can I Get It Now?	Col 14247-D,	Chronological Classics 658

All participants at their characteristic best. Metcalf very off-beat here and swinging. Great James P. in duo. Even Bradford sings jazzy and in tune here.

Notes:

- Rust*2: Louis Metcalfe (cnt); James P. Johnson (pno); Perry Bradford (vcl).
- Mahoney, Columbia 13/14000-D Series: Files: Louis Metcalf, tpt; James P. Johnson, pno; Perry Bradford, vcl.
- Rust*3,*4,*6: Louis Metcalf -c; James P. Johnson -p; Perry Bradford -v.

044 **CLARENCE WILLIAMS' BLUE SEVEN** New York, Sep. 23, 1927
 Louis Metcalf – tpt; Charlie Irvis – tbn;
 Albert Socarras – alt, clt; Arville Harris – ten, clt;
 Clarence Williams – pno; Leroy Harris – bjo; Cyrus St. Clair - bbs

81472-A	Baby, Won't You Please Come Home?	OK 8510,	Chronological Classics 736
81473-A	Close Fit Blues	OK 8510,	Chronological Classics 736

Much against my own estimation some years ago in the course of our Clarence Williams project, I have now to accept that this is certainly Louis Metcalf on trumpet here, and not Anderson or Gaines as assumed by us earlier! This is what we have stated earlier: *For years now, Louis Metcalf has been named as trumpet player on this session. But we think that there is nothing recalling Metcalf's style (listen to all the Ellington recordings of the time). Our group does not agree whether the trumpet player is Anderson or Charlie Gaines.*

While listening all recordings attributed to Metcalf in a steady row it becomes apparent that here we have all Metcalf's characteristics as heard before, only a bit tamed and thus retained by being encompassed in a Williams-led conception. Typical Irvis legato playing. Socarras and Arville Harris certainly are the reed-men as indentified in our earlier effort, and the rhythm section is the regular Williams rhythm section of this time.

Notes:

- Rust*2: Charlie Gaines or Louis Metcalf (cnt); Charlie Irvis (tbn); Buster Bailey (?)(clt, alt); Arville Harris (?)(clt, ten); Clarence Williams (pno); Leroy Harris (bjo); Cyrus St. Clair (bbs).
- Rust*3,*4,*6: Louis Metcalf -c; Charlie Irvis -tb; Buster Bailey, ?Arville Harris -cl -as; Clarence Williams -p; Leroy Harris -bj; Cyrus St. Clair -bb.

045 **DUKE ELLINGTON AND HIS ORCHESTRA** New York, Oct. 06, 1927

046	DUKE ELLINGTON AND HIS ORCHESTRA	New York,	Oct. 26, 1927
047	DUKE ELLINGTON AND HIS ORCHESTRA	New York,	Nov. 03, 1927
048	DUKE ELLINGTON AND HIS ORCHESTRA	New York,	Dec. 19, 1927
049	DUKE ELLINGTON AND HIS COTTON CLUB ORCHESTRA	New York,	Dec. 29, 1927
050	THE WASHINGTONIANS	New York,	Jan. 09, 1928
051	DUKE ELLINGTON AND HIS ORCHESTRA	New York,	Jan. 19, 1928
052	THE WASHINGTONIANS	New York,	Mar. 1928
053	THE WASHINGTONIANS	New York,	Mar. 21, 1928
054	DUKE ELLINGTON AND HIS ORCHESTRA	New York,	Jun. 05, 1928
	<i>Note: This obviously is Metcalf's last recording session as member of the Duke Ellington band.</i>		
055	MARY DIXON	New York,	Jul. 30, 1928
	Mary Dixon – voc;		
	<i>Louis Metcalf</i> – tpt; J.C. Johnson – pno		
E-27912	Dusky Stevedore	Voc 1199,	Document DOCD-5504
E-27913	I Can't Give You Anything But Love	Voc 1199,	Document DOCD-5504

This trumpet player may well be Metcalf as assumed for so long now. But this is not certain! He displays a fat tone, good technique and phrasing, but there is nothing to unequivocally identify Metcalf from. Yet, searching for an alternative name for this player is useless: there is no! But I am a bit astounded of this trumpeter's soft and tension-less performance. This might have been the consequence of Metcalf's time with Ellington and other high-graded bands and their professional and legitimate delivery. Compared to the trumpeter on Mary Dixon's session of 24 August 1929 below – who definitely is Metcalf – there remain doubts as to this musician's identity with Metcalf. This player almost sounds like a white player. It would be interesting to get to know the source for this personnel!

J.C. Johnson hailed from Chicago and – although living in New York for a long time of his life – stylistically did not belong to the group of Harlem Stride pianists. His approach to the keyboard was less rhythmic and swinging, but more bringing his compositional talents to the fore.

Notes:

- Carey, McCarthy, *Jazz Directory, Vol. 2: vcl with unknown acc.*

- Rust*3; *4, *6: *Louis Metcalf -c; J.C. Johnson -p.*

- BGR*2, *3, *4: *Louis Metcalf, cnt; J.C. Johnson, -pno.*

056	GULF COAST SEVEN	New York,	Oct. 19, 1928
	Louis Metcalf – tpt; Joe Nanton – tbn;		
	unknown – alt; Emmett Matthews – sop, ten;		
	James P. Johnson – pno; unknown - dms;		
	Perry Bradford – voc (2)		
147151-1	Daylight Savin' Blues	Col 14373-D,	Frog DGF 56
147152-1	Georgia's Always On My Mind	Col 14373-D,	Frog DGF 56

For many years this coupling has been seen as an offshoot of the Ellington band of the day under Perry Bradford's superintendence. The undeniable presence of Louis Metcalf, a seemingly familiar trombonist out of the Ellington circle and a fluent and secure soprano player: this must have been a unit comprised of Ellington men. But it is not that easy!

First: Louis Metcalf's presence must be undisputed because of his very personal style of squeezed tone and individual phrasing. But second, the trombonist seems not to be as obvious as Metcalf. Very probably the man is Nanton, but there also are traces of Charlie Irvis in his playing which should not be disregarded. And it should be kept in mind that Rex Stewart wrote in 'Jazz Masters of the 30s': "*Tricky's trumpet buddy was Louis Metcalf.*"

The alto player has been listed as Johnny Hodges on the strength of the presence of prominent soprano playing. But here we have a real problem! The style is not Hodges' at all! Neither on soprano nor on alto. The soprano can only be heard together with the alto, never together with the tenor. And when we hear the tenor, the soprano is silent. This urges us to the recognition that the altoist cannot be the soprano player. Above all, the altoist can only be heard playing in harmony with the tenor and in free ensemble with the soprano. This means that the tenor player also plays the soprano! And the altoist is not Hodges nor the otherwise presumed Charlie Holmes because the altoist cannot be heard in solo, which would necessarily be the case if Hodges or Holmes would have been present – and because of stylistic unsuitability. Consequently - in lack of solo playing - it is impossible to identify the alto player. His ensemble playing certainly lacks the elegance and finesse of either Hodges or Holmes.

With Hodges out of the way and no clarinet at all on these sides there consequently is no need to identify Barney Bigard. And the tenor playing is much too crude to be by Bigard. This player obviously prefers soprano as his main instrument, he plays tenor only in harmony with the alto. This then makes us search for a distinct soprano player at the time in question. He may be found in Emmett Matthews, a singer and reed player who came to New York with Wen Talbert and his Orchestra in 1927 where he was engaged as a tenor player. In his "You Don't Know Me, But .." p. 13 George Winfield recalls "*Emmett Matthews running across the stage playing his soprano*". Matthews owns a very extrovert style of music making as a singer and soprano player as shown in recordings under his own name in 1931 with singer Laura Rucker and in 1936 with a bunch of Fats Waller musicians. He also can be heard in Waller's 'I Got Rhythm' of December 1935 rising his soprano over the big band in the finale.

On piano we probably hear James P. Johnson, the master, who at that time can often be found in Bradford-directed recording groups. The drummer does not show anything attributable to Sonny Greer who obviously was only named in conjunction with the assumed Ellington connection. It is sometimes possible to get a hint to a drummer's identity from the pitch of his drums or cymbals. But then you need a reference recording which in this case is not existent. Also, that Greer uses different cymbals.

But finally, Bradford and his awful and off-pitch singing can be listed as unequivocal. This then is a weak element of the recording, indeed, but absolutely certain!

Notes:

- Rust*2: *Bubber Miley (cnt); unknown (tbn); unknown (sop, alt); unknown (alt); unknown (pno); unknown (dms); P. Bradfoed (voc).*
 - Rust*3, *4, *6 have: *Louis Metcalf -c; ?Joe Nanton -tb; Johnny Hodges -ss -as; ?Barney Bigard -cl -ts; James P. Johnson -p; unknown -dr; Perry Bradford -v.*
 - Rust*6: *Louis Metcalf, c; ?Joe Nanton, tb; Johnny Hodges, ss, as; ?Barney Bigard, cl, ts; James P. Johnson, p; ?Sonny Greer, dr; Perry Bradford, v.*

057 KING OLIVER AND HIS DIXIE SYNCOPATORS

New York,

Nov. 14, 1928

King Oliver – ldr;

Louis Metcalf – tpt; J.C. Higginbotham – tbn;

Charlie Holmes – alt; Teddy Hill – ten, clt;

Luis Russell – pno; Will Johnson – bjo, gtr; Bass Moore – bbs; Paul Barbarin – dms

E-28757-A or -B Slow And Steady

Br 4469,

Frog DGF 35

E-28757-G Slow And Steady

Br unissued

not on LP/CD

I am unable to discover any note played by King Oliver on this side. Everything played by a trumpet comes from Metcalf: the lead in the first and last chorus and the muted tpt solo. The harmonic third part is played by the trombone and there is no second brass part which would have been Oliver's duty.

The only reed solo is played on a clarinet – not a soprano sax – and is obviously from Teddy Hill. He is reported not to be a skilled improviser, and the solo is written out completely with its obtrusive jumping-trills. The alto sax can be heard in the ensemble together with trumpet and trombone immediately before and after the clarinet solo, so that there would have been no time to change instruments by the altoist.

Notes:

- Rust*2: *King Oliver, Louis Metcalfe (cnt); J.C. Higginbotham (tbn); Charlie Holmes (clt, sop, alt); Teddy Hill (?) (ten); Luis Russell (pno); Will Johnson (bjo); Bass Moore (bbs); Paul Barbarin (dms).*

- Rust*3, *4, *6: *King Oliver, Louis Metcalf -c; J.C. Higginbotham -tb; Charlie Holmes -cl, ss, as; Teddy Hill or Greely Walton -cl, ts; Luis Russell -p; Will Johnson -bj; Bass Moore -bb; Paul Barbarin -d.*

- *W.C. Allen, B. Rust, L. Wright, "King" Oliver: King Oliver, c; Louis Metcalf, t; J.C. Higginbotham, tb; Charlie Holmes, as, ss; Teddy Hill, ts; Luis Russell, p; Will Johnson, bj, g; William Bass Moore, bb; Paul Barbarin, d.*

- *Storyville 2002-3, Brian Goggin, Some Observations on Mutes: "The wa-wa sound that Louis Metcalf and in most cases Oliver (? - KBR) made was achieved with the old C.G. Conn metal mute, rather than with the rubber plunger or another mute in conjunction with the plunger. Etc. ..."*

058 KING OLIVER AND HIS RECORDING ORCHESTRA

New York,

Jan. 14, 1929

Joe King Oliver – dir;

Louis Metcalf – tpt; J.C. Higginbotham – tbn;

Charlie Holmes – alt, clt; Teddy Hill – ten, clt;

Luis Russell – pno; Will Johnson – bjo; Bass Moore – bbs; Paul Barbarin – dms;

49649 Freakish Light Blues

Vic unissued

not on LP/CD

As no test pressings seem to have survived and be known, nothing can be said about this unissued side. The band obviously is Luis Russell's.

Notes:

- Rust*2: *Louis Metcalfe (cnt); J.C. Higginbotham (tbn); Charlie Holmes (clt, sop, alt); Teddy Hill or Greely Walton (clt, ten); Luis Russell (pno); Will Johnson (bjo); Bass Moore (bbs); Paul Barbarin (dms).*

- Rust*3: *Louis Metcalf -c; J.C. Higginbotham -tb; Charlie Holmes -cl, ss, as; Teddy Hill or Greely Walton -cl, ts; Luis Russell -p; Will Johnson -bj; Bass Moore -bb; Paul Barbarin -d.*

- *W.C. Allen, B. Rust, L. Wright, "King" Oliver: King Oliver, dir unknown personnel of c; tb; 2 sax; p; bj; tuba; traps*

- Rust*6: *King Oliver, dir: c; tb; 2 reedmen; p; bj; bb; traps. Personnel is probably similar to next session, at which this selection was remade. These takes were destroyed, and the recording card states, "Date called off account of noise in system."*

059 LUIS RUSSELL AND HIS BURNING EIGHT

New York,

Jan. 15, 1929

Louis Metcalf – tpt; J.C. Higginbotham – tbn;

Charlie Holmes – alt, clt; Teddy Hill – ten, clt;

Luis Russell – pno; Will Johnson – bjo, gtr; Bass Moore – bbs; Paul Barbarin – dms;

Walter Pichon – voc (3)

401532-A Savoy Shout

OK 8760,

Retrieval RTR 79023

401533-B The Call Of The Freaks

OK 8656,

Retrieval RTR 79023

401534-A It's Tight Like That

OK 8656,

Retrieval RTR 79023

This then is the new and genuine Luis Russell band – definitely a descendent of Oliver's Dixie Syncopators – with one trumpet only, Louis Metcalf, before the advent of Henry Red Allen. But under Russell's name, now.

A very beautiful photo of this particular band appeared recently at www.riverwalkjazz.com, showing the personnel above, but with an invisible alto saxophonist – with the exception of the saxophone's neck and the musician's one foot. Most interestingly this musician's name is given as Leonard Fields - and not Charlie Holmes. Leonard Fields was part of June Clark's band at Smalls' Sugar Cane Club in 1925 and later of Alex Jackson and his Plantation Orchestra, recorded for Gennett in Richmond in September/October 1927. He was famous for his very fine and educated style comprising fast fingering and double and triple tongue work. He was not known before for being part of the early Luis Russell Band.

Notes:

- Rust*2: *Louis Metcalfe (cnt); J.C. Higginbotham (tbn); Albert Nicholas (clt, alt); Charlie Holmes (alt); Teddy Hill (ten); Luis Russell (pno); Will Johnson (bjo); Bass Moore (bbs); Paul Barbarin (dms); Walter Pichon (vcl).*

- Rust*3: Louis Metcalf -c; J.C. Higginbotham -tb; Charlie Holmes -cl, as; Teddy Hill -ts; Luis Russell -p -ldr; Will Johnson -bj -g; Bass Moore -bb; Paul Barbarin -d; Walter Pichon -v.
 - Rust*4,*6: Luis Russell, p, dir; Louis Metcalf, t; J.C. Higginbotham, tb; Charlie Holmes, cl, as; Teddy Hill, cl, ts; Will Johnson -bj -g; Bass Moore -bb; Paul Barbarin -d; Walter Pichon -v.

060 KING OLIVER AND HIS ORCHESTRA

New York,

Jan. 16, 1929

Joe King Oliver – dir;
 Louis Metcalf – tpt; J.C. Higginbotham – tbn;
 Charlie Holmes – alt, clt; Teddy Hill – ten, clt;
 Luis Russell – pno; Will Johnson – bjo, gtr; Bass Moore – bbs; Paul Barbarin – dms;
 Walter Pichon – voc (4,5)
 49649 Freakish Light Blues
 49650-1 West End Blues
 49650-2 West End Blues
 49651-1 I’ve Got That Thing
 49651-2 I’ve Got That Thing

Vic unissued	not on LP/CD
Vic uniss 78,	JSP CD 348
Vic V-38034,	JSP CD 347
Vic uniss 78,	JSP CD 348
Vic V-38521,	JSP CD 347

Undeniably Metcalf as trumpet player with the early Russell band. Joe King Oliver does not play on these sides! This band is the nucleus of the later Luis Russell Orchestra.

Notes:

- Rust*2: Louis Metcalf (cnt); J.C. Higginbotham (tbn); Charlie Holmes (clt, sop, alt); Teddy Hill or Greely Walton (clt, ten); Luis Russell (pno); Will Johnson (bjo); Bass Moore (bbs); Paul Barbarin (dms); Walter Pichon (vcl).
 - Rust*3: Louis Metcalf -c; J.C. Higginbotham -tb; Charlie Holmes -cl, ss, as; Teddy Hill or Greely Walton -cl, ts; Luis Russell -p; Will Johnson -bj; Bass Moore -bb; Paul Barbarin -d; Walter Pichon -v.
 - Rust*4,*6: King Oliver dir; Louis Metcalf -c; J.C. Higginbotham -tb; Charlie Holmes -cl, ss, as; Teddy Hill or Greely Walton -cl, ts; Luis Russell -p; Will Johnson -bj; Bass Moore -bb; Paul Barbarin -d; Walter Pichon -v.
 - W.C. Allen, B. Rust, L. Wright, “King” Oliver: Louis Metcalf, t; J.C. Higginbotham, tb; Charlie Holmes, as; Teddy Hill, ts; Luis Russell, p; Will Johnson, bj; William Bass Moore, bb; Paul Barbarin, d; Walter ‘Fats’ Pichon, v; Joe ‘King’ Oliver, dir.

Notable differences of takes:

49650-1: (Armstrong-) introduction: trumpet starts with 3 quarter-notes f – eb - c
 49650-2: (Armstrong-) introduction: trumpet starts with 3 quarter-notes g – eb - c
 49651-1: End of tune: trumpet plays 2 quarter-notes b - bb
 49651-2: End of tune: trumpet plays 2 quarter-notes f - g

061 MUSICAL STEVEDORES

New York,

Jan. 30, 1929

Ward Pinkett – tpt, scat voc; Henry Hicks – tbn; Charlie Holmes – clt, alt;
 Cliff Jackson – pno; Elmer Snowden – bjo; Bud Hicks – bbs; unknown – percussion effects;
 unknown - arr
 147899-3 Happy Rhythm
 147900-3 Honeycomb Harmony

Col 14406-D,	Frog DGF 32
Col 14406-D,	Frog DGF 32

These two titles are not just straight-ahead jazz performances, but they are distinct – and beautiful – little compositions, by all means, in a sense of – for instance – Duke Ellington’s creations. Composer credits for both items are “Williams”, without any first name. This might have led to the assumption that Spencer Williams, one of the early group of jazz composers (think of ‘Shim-Me-Sha-Wobble’), could be responsible for the authorship – and the piano part here.

For all the years I have listened to these sides – they had been part of a long deleted Swedish EP Pirates 514 – it had been a firm and fixed truth that Louis Metcalf – he very probably also on the following three sessions under Elmer Snowden’s direction – was the trumpet player on these titles. But Storyville 2000, p. 121, reports information as to the possible presence of Ward Pinkett on trumpet and on vocal here. And indeed, if you listen closely and without pre-fixed opinion the trumpet sounds do correspond with what we all know of the brilliant Mr. Pinkett. And we also know that Pinkett could be a fantastic growl-man, what can be heard exemplarily in the second title. There is no second trumpet player!

The trombonist is Henry Hicks, one of the main-stays of the early Mills’ Blue Rhythm Band. Born in 1904 he played with the Wilberforce Collegians aka Benny Carter’s Savoy Play Boys under Benny Carter’s leadership in 1928/9 – which in itself is a great recommendation – and later joined the Mills’ Blue Rhythm Band to disappear into oblivion in 1934. He was a first-class hot soloist, and Snowden certainly became aware of his qualities to hire him for the four sessions of early 1929 dealt with here. Further proof of his importance is Jan Evensmo’s presenting him in his renowned series of “Solographies” – one among only four trombonists in this series.

On the reed instruments we hear the great Charlie Holmes from Boston, later one of the star soloists of the Luis Russell band. At the time of these recordings, he certainly also was one of the few highly gifted youngsters on the Harlem jazz scene. He plays alto sax, soprano and clarinet on these three issued sessions, and can be assumed on the unissued ‘Six Scrambled Eggs’ session as well.

As said before, Spencer Williams has been assumed as piano player because of the composer credits of both titles. Yet, the piano bass notes with their shifting of the meter are so decidedly and typically of Cliff Jackson that he himself must be listed as pianist. Most of the discographies – including John Collinson’s in Storyville 147 – assume or agree in Cliff Jackson’s presence as pianist. I myself have to reduce my own assumption a bit because of the lack of Jackson’s otherwise so apparent rhythmic strength. Unfortunately, Spencer Williams can only be found two times in the index to Rust*6: as pianist of the ‘Six Scrambled Eggs’ (see below) and as singer with ‘Freddie Johnson - Arthur Briggs and their All-Star Orchestra in Paris, Farnce, July 1933 (and he very probably was in Europe at about this recording date). This then leaves us without any recorded example of Williams’ piano style and makes comparison impossible.

On banjo, recognizable by his own personal and very busy banjo style with up-and-down strumming, tremolos and trills – as opposed to the strong and plain rhythm playing of for instance a Dave Wilborn or a Buddy Christian – is Elmer Snowden, he himself sometime the leader of up to five bands at the same time as stated elsewhere.

Bud Hicks is a name only listed once in Rust – for this session – and I am unable to name any band of importance in the Harlem years of which he might have been a member. But he definitely plays with beauty and sensitivity and makes good rhythm. As suggested in Storyville 154 below, you may hear some sort of percussion-strokes on a drum – or a suitcase, or whatever – between the piano solo and the scat vocal (F trio strain) and at the very end of the item. This might have been Mr. Joe Davis himself, who obviously – although not a musician himself – was fond of taking part in the recording sessions he organized.

Notes:

- Rust*2: Louis Metcalfe – tpt; Henry Hicks – tbn; Charlie Grimes, Charlie Holmes – clt, alt; Cliff Jackson – pno; Elmer Snowden – bjo; Bass Edwards – bbs; unknown – scat voc
 - Rust*3: Freddie Jenkins, Louis Metcalf – tpt; Henry Hicks – tbn; Clarence Grimes, Charlie Holmes – clt, sop, alt; Spencer Williams? – pno; Elmer Snowden – bjo; Bud Hicks – bbs; two unknown – scat voc
 - IAJRC 12, cover text: Snowden: “These sessions were all made around the same time. Some sound like Ted Nixon arrangements. He was my trombone player, and we wrote Lindbergh Hop together. Joe Davis used to throw in so many musicians that I couldn’t keep track. We used to call Henry Hicks “Reverend” cause he was so quiet. Charlie Holmes sounded a lot like Hodges, but on this record (Happy Rhythm) he sounds like Procope. We called him “Pickles”. I used to get \$25.00 a side in those days, and we recorded with all the companies. The toughest one was Edison. We couldn’t finish until the record was perfect.”
 - Rust*4: Freddie Jenkins, Louis Metcalf – tpt; Henry Hicks – tbn; Clarence Grimes, Charlie Holmes – clt, sop, alt; Cliff Jackson – pno-cymbal; Elmer Snowden – bjo; Bud Hicks – bbs; scat voc
 - Storyville 147, p.108: Freddie Jenkins, Louis Metcalf, t; Henry Hicks, tb; Clarence Grimes, cl/ss; Charlie Holmes, cl/as; prob Cliff Jackson, p; Elmer Snowden, bj; Bud Hicks, bb; 2 unknown, v. John Collinson: “I doubt that Jackson is the pianist on this session but lacking definite information it is included. Columbia files show that 3 takes of each title were recorded, with the first of each being rejected and the second marked as 2nd choice.”
 - Storyville 154, p.160, Let’s Really Listen: “Brian Williams suggests we listen to ‘Happy Rhythm’ by the Musical Stevedores with reference to the rhythm section in the second half of the side.”
 - Storyville 2000, p.121: “Clarence Grimes says he did not reach New York until 1934 and is thus not the clarinet and soprano player on the Musical Stevedores coupling. Charlie Holmes has identified himself on these sides, playing cl/ss/as and Greely Walton identifies the scat vocalist as Ward Pinkett, who is thus more likely on trumpet than Louis Metcalf, who is currently listed.”
 - Rust*6: Freddie Jenkins, Louis Metcalf – tpt; Henry Hicks – tbn; Clarence Grimes – clt; Charlie Holmes – sop, alt; Cliff Jackson – pno-cymbal; Elmer Snowden – bjo; Bud Hicks – bbs; scat voc

062 KING OLIVER AND HIS ORCHESTRA

New York,

Feb. 01, 1929

Joe King Oliver – dir;
 Louis Metcalf – tpt; J.C. Higginbotham – tbn;
 Charlie Holmes – alt, clt; Teddy Hill – ten, clt;
 Luis Russell – pno; Will Johnson – bjo, gtr; Bass Moore – bbs; Paul Barbarin – dms;
 Walter Pichon – voc (4,5)
 48332 Easy Goin’
 48333-1 Call Of The Freaks
 48333-2 Call Of The Freaks
 48334-1 The Trumpets Prayer
 48334-2 The Trumpets Prayer
 49649-3 Freakish Light Blues
 49649-4 Freakish Light Blues

Vic unissued	not on LP/CD
Vic uniss 78,	JSP CD 348
Vic V-38039,	JSP CD 347
Vic V-38039,	JSP CD 347
Vic uniss 78,	JSP CD 348
Vic uniss 78,	JSP CD 348
Vic V-38521,	JSP CD 347

And again, Metcalf as part of the early Luis Russell band. Joe King Oliver does not play on these sides!

Notes:

- Rust*2: Louis Metcalfe (cnt); J.C. Higginbotham (tbn); Charlie Holmes (clt, sop, alt); Teddy Hill or Greely Walton (clt, ten); Luis Russell (pno); Will Johnson (bjo); Bass Moore (bbs); Paul Barbarin (dms).

- Rust*3: Louis Metcalf -c; J.C. Higginbotham -tb; Charlie Holmes -cl, ss, as; Teddy Hill or Greely Walton -cl, ts; Luis Russell -p; Will Johnson -bj; Bass Moore -bb; Paul Barbarin -d.

- Rust*4,*6: King Oliver dir; Louis Metcalf -c; J.C. Higginbotham -tb; Charlie Holmes -cl, ss, as; Teddy Hill or Greely Walton -cl, ts; Luis Russell -p; Will Johnson -bj; Bass Moore -bb; Paul Barbarin -d.

- W.C. Allen, B. Rust, L. Wright, “King” Oliver: Louis Metcalf, t; J.C. Higginbotham, tb; Charlie Holmes, cl, ss, as; Teddy Hill, cl, ts; Luis Russell, p; Will Johnson, bj, g; William Bass Moore, bb; Paul Barbarin, d; Joe ‘King’ Oliver, dir.

Notable differences of takes:

48333-1: Metcalf’s entrance in his first solo immediately after tbn solo: tpt starts on first beat of first bar of solo with: 1 eighth-note bb, 1 quarter-note bb, 2 eighth-notes bb-Bb, 1 quarter-note Bb
 48333-2: Metcalf’s entrance in his first solo immediately after tbn solo: tpt starts on fourth beat of last bar of tbn solo with: 3 quarter-notes bb syncopated, 1 eighth-note f, 1 quarter-note Bb
 48334-1: Introduction: Metcalf starts with: 3 quarter-notes bb, 1 eighth-note eb, 1 half-note g
 48334-2: Introduction: Metcalf starts with: 3 quarter-notes bb, 3 eighth-notes eb-g-bb, 1 quarter-note bb
 49649-3: Start of third 8-bar stanza: Metcalf plays 5 eighth-notes C-Bb-C-Bb-C, 1 quarter-note Bb in second bar (i.e. bar 18 of title)
 49649-4: Start of third 8-bar stanza: Metcalf plays 5 eighth-notes eb-gb-b-eb-a, 1 quarter-note b in second bar (i.e. bar 18 of title), and sequence of low notes (like in take -3 above) in fourth bar

063 JIMMY JOHNSON AND HIS BAND

New York,

Mar. 05, 1929

Louis Metcalf – tpt; (Joe Nanton) – tbn;
 Albert Happy Caldwell – ten, clt; unknown – clt (if at all);
 James P. Johnson – pno; (Perry Bradford) – cymbal
 Perry Bradford, Gus Horsley – voc
 148015-1 Put Your Mind Right On It
 148016-3 Sorry

Col 14417-D,	Chronological Classics 671
Col unissued	not on LP/CD

The trumpet player does not show any definite and unequivocal Metcalf characteristics, but compared to Johnson’s ‘Fare The Honey Blues’ of 20 March 1929 (see below) there are miles between this trumpet player here and what we hear of – definitely – Louis Metcalf there! So, the reader/listener might allow me some severe doubts on Metcalf’s presence here. His playing on the latter record is very hot, urgent, full of power and strong rhythm, whereas here he – if it really is Metcalf – is tame and only plays what the head arrangement requests. This trumpet player might be any other player of sufficient technique and practice and experience. The trombone might be Joe Nanton (the dirty tones!), Metcalf’s band-mate and buddy from his time with the Ellington band. But unfortunately, too little can be heard from the trombone to really judge.

Throughout this side the clarinet mainly plays head-arranged parts. Therefore, a personal individual style almost cannot be discerned. There only are very few instances where the clarinet can be heard away from the trumpet and on its own. But here, everything that can be distinguished, is outside of Elliott's approach to clarinet playing. Attack, tone, vibrato and time are far better than what we know of Elliott, and in my opinion his presence has to be denied. As so often the assumption of Elliott as clarinetist seems to have come from the early days of discographical research as a mere esteem of someone who has not really listened and compared. What we really hear is the tenor saxophone starting together with tpt and tbn for a four-bar intro, then playing an eight-bar verse with the brass. This ad-lib tenor part at the beginning has typical Caldwell tone, rhythm and phrases. From then on it is always a clarinet – no tenor sax – with a distinct and clear Doddsish flavour, and I strongly believe that we have Happy Caldwell here. In the coda it is Caldwell on tenor again. In the third and fourth chorus there might be a second clarinet answering the brass riffs along with the first clarinet (Caldwell) in harmony, but I must admit that this harmony part might also be played by the trumpet in a very soft manner. (Why should a recording company hire a second clarinet for only two chorus in a recorded item, I ask.) I have therefore listed a possible second clarinet above in italics.

The cymbal crash might have been the work of Perry Bradford as there are more similar isolated cymbal crashes with this very sound on Bradford's recordings.

Notes:

- Ch. Delaunay, *New Hot Discography 1948*: no personnel

- Carey, McCarthy, *Jazz Directory Vol. 5: unknown 2 tpts; tbn; clt; ten; James P. Johnson (p); unknown d; male-female duet*

- Rust*2: Louis Metcalfe (tpt); unknown tbn; clt; ten; James P. Johnson (pno); unknown dms; Perry Bradford (vcl), unknown vcl.

- D. Mahoney, *Columbia 13/14000-D Series*: unknown personnel

- Rust*3,*4: Louis Metcalf - c; unknown tb; Ernest Elliott - cl; unknown cl- ts; James P. Johnson -p; Perry Bradford and another v; someone hits a cymbal hard at the end of 148015-1 but there is no evidence elsewhere on this side of a drummer.

- Rust*6: Louis Metcalf - c; unknown tb; Ernest Elliott - cl; unknown cl- ts; James P. Johnson -p; Perry Bradford and another v; there is a cymbal crash at the end of 148015-1 but there is no evidence of a drummer elsewhere on this side.

- Brown/Hilbert, James P. Johnson p 375: Louis Metcalf, cornet; unknown, trombone; Ernest Elliott, clarinet; unknown, clarinet and tenor sax; Johnson, piano; Perry Bradford, Gus Horsley, vocals. "Someone hits a cymbal at the end of 148015-1 but there is no evidence elsewhere of a drummer. It has been suggested that Bradford hit the cymbal."

064 WABASH TRIO

New York,

Mar. 1929

Walter Bennett – tpt;

J. C. Johnson – pno; Bernard Addison – gtr

3382- Hoppin' Round

3383- Lone Western Blues

3384-(A) Coal Black

3384-(B) Coal Black Blues

This is a very beautiful recording session with a trio comprising trumpet, piano and guitar. For me, this is a very interesting and demanding combination which is seldom heard. I only know of one other record with an instrumentation like this: The Harlem House Rent Stompers, recorded August 28, 1929. Obviously, this combination needs a virtuoso piano player, and you really can hear one on the Wabashes as well as on the Harlems.

Trumpet player is Walter Bennett – and definitely not Louis Metcalf - and he seems to have secured his relationship to J.C. Johnson after the very successful recording session of the Hot Sparks.

Of the piano player Davies and Wright said: "The piano playing is thoroughly competent throughout, and usually exciting when clearly heard. The style is thoroughly New York - based in stride, though not developed in this direction to the level achieved by James P.. There is no doubt in our minds that this is J.C. Johnson himself." I can only partly agree with their statement, and would only like to point out, that J.C. Johnson was not a native New Yorker but came from Chicago in 1923 (Chilton) and that his piano-style is not based on Stride. Thus, his musical influences might have been different from the ordinary New York pianist?! Be that as it may, I hear a very rewarding and virtuoso player. Dig his introduction to *Coal Black Blues* and hear what I mean!

I certainly do not doubt the presence of Bernard Addison here. The introduction to Hoppin' Round is just what I would expect from Addison: strong solo work combining chordal and single-string playing. Yet, on Coal Black Blues the guitarist plays a solo chorus in single-string throughout, which apparently made the Storyville team thinking of Bobby Leecan. Nevertheless, I do think it is Bernard Addison in his formative years. Beautiful. Davies and Wright name him a "top line musician" and are certainly right so.

In lack of the original 78 records and without specification of matrix numbers on my LPs, I have designated the two different takes as given here, take -1 (presumably!) being the musically less accurate one contained on HISTORICAL 12, take -2 (presumably), executed with more security, contained on RISTIC 26. But: this is MY own personal definition! The case might easily be the other way around! Please, be careful! To be on the safe side, I have put the self assigned take numbers in brackets! Laurens Hertzdahl of The Netherlands, author of a very substantial article on the Memphis Jazzers and Levee Syncopators sessions (see below), and who is expert in Grey Gull recordings, told me in a letter: "It's very difficult to identify different takes with Grey Gull related recordings. The letters A and B in the wax do not refer to the takes used and alternate takes can only be detected by aural comparison. To prevent confusion I would like to advise to use numbers indicating a different take instead of letters A and B."

Notes:

- Rust*2,*3,*4,*6: Louis Metcalf (cnt); J.C. Johnson (pno); Bernard Addison (bjo)

Notable differences of takes:

3384-A: last bar of intro: pno chord on measure 3, then 2 consecutive eighth notes (Bb - C) leading to chorus 1

3384-B: last bar of intro: pno chord on measure 3, then quarter pause

065 JIMMY JOHNSON AND HIS BAND

New York,

Mar. 20, 1929

Louis Metcalf – tpt; Julius Geechie Fields – tbn; unknown – clt;

James P. Johnson – pno;

Perry Bradford – voc

148108-3 Fare Thee Honey Blues

Col 14417-D, Chronological Classics 671

Now, this here really is Metcalf in full power – as compared with his assumed presence on the 05 March, 1929 session above. Very typical Louis Metcalf and probably Fields as known from Morton. And absolutely great James P.!

Again, I would deny Ernest Elliott's presence on clarinet here. Although I cannot say that this player is the same one as on the foregoing Johnson session (prob *Happy Caldwell*), his style is not what we know of Elliott now. The little flaws he plays – and also his phrases – seem to indicate, that he is a saxophone player in the first instance.

Notes:

- *Ch. Delaunay, New Hot Discography 1948: no personnel*
- *Carey, McCarthy, Jazz Directory Vol. 5: unknown tpt; tbn; clt; ten; James P. Johnson (p); unknown d; unknown male voc.*
- *Rust*2: Louis Metcalfe (tpt); unknown tbn; Ernest Elliott (clt); James P. Johnson (pno); Perry Bradford (vcl).*
- *D. Mahoney, Columbia 13/14000-D Series: unknown personnel*
- *Rust*3, *4, *6: Louis Metcalf - c; prob Geechie Fields -tb; Ernest Elliott - cl; James P. Johnson -p; Perry Bradford -v*
- *Brown/Hilbert, James P. Johnson p 375: Louis Metcalf, cornet; probably Geechie Fields, trombone; Ernest Elliott, clarinet; Johnson, piano; Perry Bradford, vocal*

066 JUNGLE TOWN STOMPERS

New York,

Apr. 09, 1929

Ward Pinkett – tpt; Henry Hicks – tbn; Charlie Holmes – clt, alt;

Luis Russell – pno, cel; Elmer Snowden – bjo; Henry Bass Edwards - bbs; unknown (Elmer Snowden ?) – percussion (2)

unknown (Luis Russell ?) – arr

401797-C African Jungle

OK 8686,

JSP CD 308

401798-B Slow As Molasses

OK 8686,

JSP CD 308

As it seems this is the same band as before (Musical Stevedores, 30 January, 1929, above) . With some minor alterations possible. But first of all: This is the same trumpet player as on the foregoing session, thus very probably Ward Pinkett. If you listen to this player's staccato playing and occasional trills and compare it with the Morton Red Hot Peppers of June 11, 1928, you will easily see/hear that this is the same person. And this really is a very surprising realization! For all the years of discography Metcalf had been stated as trumpet player here. But after the note in Storyville 2000, p.121 this certainly cannot be retained. It is my suspicion that Luis Russell when being asked recalled titles he simply did not have played on (see Storyville 146, p.46 below). The record label does not say anything about the musicians (L. Wright, Okeh Race Records). And on hearing these titles - with certainly Charlie Holmes on them - he deduced a personnel from his own band, including himself on piano. But I am convinced that we have Pinkett here. It is the same tone, same sound, same vibrato and same staccato as on the Mortons! Apparently, Russell named Metcalf as he was on the Burning Eight sides at the beginning of Russell's recording career and only 3 months apart from this session. But our trumpet man here does not use Metcalf's squeezed notes, and he plays with more laziness – not as stressed as Metcalf always does.

On trombone we most probably have Henry Hicks again as stated everywhere, and I do not know anything against it, but I have to observe that everything played by the trombone on these two sides might also be played by Higginbotham, only lacking Higgie's little tricks and close trills and his exuberant bounce. No wonder that Luis Russell heard Higginbotham here. But should Higgie be "reading his solos"? The alto saxophonist is Charlie Holmes again to my conviction. This alto sound is unmistakable. Only on clarinet he obviously was not as skilled as on his main instrument, and you hear typically reduced clarinet playing as from a saxophonist.

Luis Russell recognized himself as piano player and arranger (see Storyville 146, p.46) which certainly led to this record always being reissued under the Luis Russell flag. Yet, a big and severe doubt may be allowed as to this statement. We have so often come to know of musicians' distinctly wrong estimations of their own or other's playing, that I would not be surprised that somebody else is responsible for the piano part here. The short solo on celeste has a bit of Russell's airy piano style, although not of his usual hasty piano playing, and without any distinct reason to leave him out of consideration I shall certainly keep him in the personnel. The time would be that of the building process of the Russell band: there still was no Red Allen and no Pops Foster. And Russell might have been willing to play for another bandleader and get some additional cash. But the arrangements heard here are not in Russell's style as shown on his own later recordings, and I therefore would deny his authorship.

On banjo we have Elmer Snowden the bandleader again.

Rust lists Henry Bass Edwards on tuba throughout. Although I know Edwards as a very skilled and proficient tuba player I also know him to display very short and hart-hitting notes I do not hear on these sides. Lacking any distinct tuba features I therefore would leave him listed in the personnel. Russell claimed Bass Moore – his own tuba player at the time – as bass player.

Finally we hear some sort of drumming (snare-drum, played with brushes) behind the celesta solo. No bass drum, no cymbals. If it was not for the extremely short changing-over from banjo to drum – no beat left out - I would have named Snowden himself as the "drummer", the more so as there are two bars between the end of drumming and the entrance of the banjo again. And just remember that we also had some very few "drum strokes" on the Musical Stevedores session. So, this might have been Elmer Snowden or rather the organizer of the session, Mr. Joe Davis. I do not see any reason to name Kaiser Marshall as in earlier Rusts. Can you imagine star-drummer Kaiser Marshall playing at a session for only half a chorus and without being member of the band? Oh yes, life happens!

Some people claim to hear a tenor sax and even a second trumpet somewhere on these sides. The second trumpet I would exclude instantly, but there certainly are instances where a tenor sax might be suspected. But there are no distinct tenor parts to be heard - and no solos – and any possible tenor part – together with the alto – is played softly by the trombone (for instance part C in the first title).

Notes:

- *Rust*2: Louis Metcalfe – tpt; Henry Hicks – tbn; Charlie Holmes – clt, alt; Charlie Grimes – ten; Clarence Williams ? – pno, cel; Elmer Snowden – bjo; Bass Edwards – bbs; unknown – dms*
- *Rust*3: Louis Metcalf – tpt; Henry Hicks – tbn; Charlie Holmes – clt, alt; Charlie Grimes – ten; Luis Russell – pno, cel; Elmer Snowden – bjo; Bass Edwards – bbs; Kaiser Marshall ? – dms (2)*
- *Rust*4: Louis Metcalf – tpt; Henry Hicks – tbn; Charlie Holmes – clt, alt; Charlie Grimes – ten; Luis Russell – pno, cel; Elmer Snowden – bjo; Henry Edwards – bbs; with percussion effect on the second side.*
- *Storyville 146, p46 (Luis Russell interview by Walter C. Allen): "(I) played Okeh 8686 (Jungle Town Stompers). (Luis Russell) didn't recall the titles until hearing it. Gave identifications of: growl and open solos by Louis Metcalf, trombone by Higgy – reading solos; alto and soprano by Holmes; Johnson, Moore (or Buford?); Luis Russell arrangement, piano and celeste – never saw the latter before and fooled around with it in the studio and used it on the record."*
- *Storyville 152, p80, Let's Really Listen: K.B. Rau comments that the instrumentation of the Jungle Town Stompers and Jasper Davis and his Orchestra is not as given in Rust and elsewhere – what do you hear?"*
- *Storyville 153, p120: "Several readers agree entirely with Rust for both groups. For 'Slow As Molasses' John Snow and Brian Williams offer t/tb/cl/p-cel/bb/d with the drums replaced by banjo on the reverse. They also feel that a second trumpet may be present on 'African Jungle' and that a second sax may be present on both sides."*
- *Rust*6: Louis Metcalf, t; Henry Hicks, tb; Charlie Holmes, cl, as; Charlie Grimes, ts; Luis Russell, p, cel; Elmer Snowden, bj; Henry Edwards, bb; with percussion effect on the second side.*

067 **SIX SCRAMBLED EGGS**

Ward Pinkett – tpt; Henry Hicks – tbn; Charlie Holmes – clt;
 Spencer Williams – pno; Elmer Snowden – bjo; Bass Moore – bbs; Paul Barbarin – dms;
 Jasper Davis – dir; Ken Macomber – arr

New York, Apr. 18, 1929

51187-2 Magnolia Blues

Vic unissued

not on LP/CD

51188-2 Soft Shoe Shuffle

Vic unissued

not on LP/CD

Unfortunately – and much to my grief – these two sides have been rejected and unissued by the Victor people. And although the Victor vaults have dismissed a whole lot of their own great unissued jazz music in later years, these two sides were not among them, if there perhaps is somebody somewhere who owns them secretly on a test pressing. I'd be very much interested to hear them! It certainly would be interesting where Rust received his information as to the personnel from! And we definitely have to use them with great caution! The trumpet player would very probably also have been Ward Pinkett, and not Metcalf!

Notes:

- Rust*2,*3,*4,*6: probably: Louis Metcalfe – tpt; Henry Hicks – tbn; Charlie Holmes – alt; Spencer Williams – pno; Elmer Snowden – bjo; Bass Moore – bbs; Paul Barbarin – dms; Jasper Davis, Ken Macomber – dir
 - Rust, Victor Master Book Vol. 2: Joe Davis – Ken Macomber/ c/ tb/ s/ p/ bj/ bb/ d.

068 **GEORGIA GIGOLOS** (Jasper Davis and his Orchestra)

Ward Pinkett – tpt; Henry Hicks – tbn; Charlie Holmes – clt, alt;
 unknown – pno; Elmer Snowden – bjo; Ernest Bass Moore – bbs;
 Lizzie Miles – voc

New York, Apr. 23, 1929

148465-3 Georgia Gigolo

Har 944-H,

Frog DGF 38

148468-2 It Feels So Good

Har 944-H,

Frog DGF 38

These sides have formerly always been issued under the name of “Jasper Davis and his Orchestra” (see Rust*6 below).

I have my doubts as to the trumpet player. He probably is the same as before, thus Ward Pinkett, yet not as distinct as before. He is not Metcalf, but I am unable to name anybody else. (The recorded sound is rather bad, unfortunately, caused by Harmony's un-timely use of the acoustic recording equipment!)

On trombone we certainly have Henry Hicks again, this time more distinct than on the Jungle Town Stompers session. He is a marvellous player, legitimate and ad-lib, and his unfamiliarity to the public may only be explained by his sudden disappearance in 1934. He was a player of the future.

Charlie Holmes is the reed player again, on alto and on clarinet, as before. As on the Jungle Town Stompers sides no second alto can be discovered, nor any other saxophone. As to the listed name of Charlie Grimes – who, by the way, is Clarence Grimes with the Musical Stevedores - it has to be added that these last two sessions are the only sessions in Rust listed for Charlie Grimes, and that Clarence Grimes did not arrive in New York earlier than 1934 – as for his own documented statement.

The piano player does not solo at all, with the exception of two very short breaks – 1 bar each – in ‘It Feels So Good’ A8, which does not leave any room for suggesting this player's identity. Three names have been suggested so far - Cliff Jackson, Louis Hooper or J.C. Johnson – but I do not see any reason to attribute what can be heard to any of these names, and I would therefore leave him as unknown.

We certainly hear Elmer Snowden with his own banjo sound.

There cannot be detected anything what might identify the tuba player. He may be Bass Moore, but this association might only be the consequence of the supposed presence of Luis Russell musicians. So, he equally might be someone else.

This Georgia Gigolos session is not as thoroughly arranged as the earlier ones, and thus leaves much more room for ad-lib improvisation than before. It also shows the benefit of Lizzie Miles's presence.

Notes:

- Rust*2: Louis Metcalfe and another – tpt; Henry Hicks – tbn; Charlie Holmes – clt, alt; Charlie Grimes? – alt; Cliff Jackson? – pno, cel; Elmer Snowden – bjo; Bass Moore – bbs; Lizzie Miles - voc

- Rust*3: Louis Metcalf and another – tpt; Henry Hicks – tbn; Charlie Holmes – clt, alt; Charlie Grimes? – alt; Cliff Jackson? or Louis Hooper (or possibly J.C. Johnson) – pno; Elmer Snowden – bjo; Ernest Moore – bbs; Lizzie Miles - voc

- Rust*4: Louis Metcalf and another – tpt; Henry Hicks – tbn; Charlie Holmes – clt, alt; Charlie Grimes – alt; ?J.C. Johnson – pno; Elmer Snowden – bjo; Ernest Moore – bbs; Lizzie Miles – voc. (“Jasper Davis” is probably a pseudonym – for whom?)

- Storyville 147, p.109: Louis Metcalf, unknown, c; Henry Hicks, tb; Charlie Holmes, cl/as; Charlie Grimes, as; prob Cliff Jackson, p; Elmer Snowden, bj; Bass Moore, bb; Lizzie Miles, v. John Collinson: “This session was originally entered in the files as by The Gigolos and 3 takes were made of each title, take -2 of the first and take -1 of the second being rejected with the others as second choices. ... Jasper Davis is thought to be a pseudonym for Joe Davis, who organized the session. Again, I am not convinced of Jackson's presence here and would welcome the opinion of others.”

- Storyville 152, p80, Let's Really Listen: “K.B. Rau comments that the instrumentation of the Jungle Town Stompers and Jasper Davis and his Orchestra is not as given in Rust and elsewhere – what do you hear?”

- Storyville 153, p120: “Several readers agree entirely with Rust for both groups. ... For Jasper Davis they hear t/tb/2as/p/bj/bb/v with one sax player switching to cl on the second side. Again they think there is a suspicion of a second trumpet on both sides.”

- BGR*4: Louis Metcalf, unknown – cnt; Henry Hicks – tbn; Charlie Holmes – alt, clt; Charlie Grimes – alt; poss Cliff Jackson – pno; Elmer Snowden – bjo; Bass Moore – bbs

- Rust*6: Louis Metcalf, c; Henry Hicks, tb; Charlie Holmes, cl, ss, as; Charlie Grimes, as; ? J.C. Johnson, p; Elmer Snowden, bj; Ernest Moore, bb; Lizzie Miles, v. All issues as Jasper Davis and his Orchestra. Davis was a Harlem bandleader, but the Columbia files list this session under the Georgia Gigolos name, with no indication of Davis' presence.

069 **MARY DIXON**

Mary Dixon – voc;
 Louis Metcalf – tpt;
 J.C. Johnson – pno; (Bernard Addison) - gtr

New York, Aug. 24, 1929

148923-1 Black Dog Blues

Col 14459-D,

Document DOCD-5504

148924-2 Fire And Thunder Blues

Col 14459-D,

Document DOCD-5504

This certainly is Metcalf with his own double-time phrasing as heard so often in Ellington's recordings, and his beautiful and big tone. The trio is completed by J.C. Johnson's rhapsodic style, rhythmically more on the Chicago side. The full-bodied guitar is restricted to plain

rhythm playing, with the only exception to play a single-string break in the introduction of *Black Dog Blues*. With regard of the Wabash Trio recordings of J.C. Johnson of this same month and year I opt for the possible – or probable – presence of Bernard Addison.

Notes:

- Carey, McCarthy, *Jazz Directory, Vol. 2: Acc. cor; p; g.*
- Mahony, *Columbia 13/14000 Series: probably Louis Metcalf, cnt; J.C. Johnson, p; unknown, g*
- Rust*3,*4,*6: *Louis Metcalf -c; J.C. Johnson -p; unknown g.*
- BGR*2,*3,*4: *Louis Metcalf, cnt; J.C. Johnson, -pno; unknown gtr.*

070 **LUIS RUSSELL AND HIS ORCHESTRA**

New York,

Sep. 06, 1929

Bill Coleman, Henry Red Allen – tpt; J.C. Higginbotham – tbn;
 Charlie Holmes, Albert Nicholas – alt, clt; Teddy Hill – ten, clt;
 Luis Russell – pno, ldr; Will Johnson – bjo, gtr; Paul Barbarin – dms, vib;
 Henry Red Allen, J.C. Higginbotham, Louis Metcalf – voc trio (1)

402938-C	The New Call Of The Freaks	OK 8734,	JSP CD 308
402939-C	Feeling The Spirit	OK 8766,	JSP CD 308
402940-B	Jersey Lightning	OK 8734,	JSP CD 308

This now is the Luis Russell band as we know them best, with Red Allen as dominant trumpet soloist. And there would be no reason to list these sides in a Metcalf discography, didn't we know that Metcalf is one of the vocalists singing on 'The New Call Of The Freaks' by his own testimony in Storyville 51 (below). He is the man answering the call "Stick out your can, here comes the garbidge man" with "In the morning" and "In the evening" respectively. So, now we also know his voice!

There is nothing that needs be said about this Luis Russell Band.

Notes:

- *Storyville 51-87, Al Vollmer, Some Notes on Clarence Jones ... and Others: "Metcalf also told me that he is present as vocalist on Luis Russell's 'The New Call Of The Freaks'. He had just returned to New York from a tour with a show, and Russell called him up and said that the band was going to record his tune, and would he like to come down and do the vocal. So, although he was not a member of the band he, Red Allen and Higgy did the vocalising. Louis' voice is the one that says, "In the morning" and, "In the evening". He added that he did not have his horn along."*

071 **BESSIE SMITH**

New York,

Jun. 11, 1931

Bessie Smith – voc;
 Louis Metcalf – tpt; William B. Christian – tbn;
 unknown – pno; unknown – dms

151594-1	In The House Blues	Col 14611-D,	Frog DGF 47
151595-3	Long Old Road	Col 14663-D,	Frog DGF 47
151596-1	Blue Blue	Col 14611-D,	Frog DGF 47
151597-3	Shipwreck Blues	Col 14663-D,	Frog DGF 47

- From his own testimony (see Source -4) we know that Metcalf was the trumpet player at this session. Metcalf is not on any of the above sessions!

- Chris Hillman in his comment to this session's trombonist (see Sources -4 and -6 below) points to the similarity of both sessions. Yet, it has to be remarked that Robert "Red" Freeman of his own session is a much more accomplished trombone player than the trombonist at this Bessie Smith session. It is also interesting, of what primitive and rough playing Charlie Green has been associated with, as he was listed as trombonist for a long time. Our player here is very unsophisticated, insensitive and in my opinion unsuitable to Bessie's needs. In 1978 Rust*4 then presented the name of a certain William B. Christian, who - in an article in the Chicago Defender of 18 July 1931 - was noted "to have just finished recording with Bessie Smith" (John Capes, booklet to CD Frog DGF 47). Because of this trombonist's absolutely single appearance on any known recording of jazz/blues of the time I feel empowered to see this man as the most probable originator of what can be heard. (BGR*4 still lists Charlie Green, which certainly is way off the mark!) He might have been a player in some vaudeville or tent show with little sophistication and style. This then might be a clue as to the origin of pianist and drummer.

- There is nothing in this pianist's style that reminds us only remotely of Clarence Williams. This pianist is more on the blues oriented side of the pianistic spectrum than Clarence Williams or all the Harlem pianists who could be considered. Lacking obvious signs of individual style, I feel unable to offer any distinct possibility of this player's person.

- Although the drumming at the 'Trombone Red' session also bears some kind of raggedness, its counterpart here is not really congruent. Our man here uses devices different from the 'Trombone Red' session – i.e. some kind of tin-can cowbell and a different cymbal. But there also are distinct dissimilarities of technique which would deny the identity of both players.

In consequence: this Bessie Smith session of June 11, 1931 has nothing in common with the 'Trombone Red and his Blue Six' session!

Notes:

- Mahony, *Columbia 13/14000 Series: Files: acc Louis Bacon, tpt; Charlie Green, tbn; Clarence Williams, p; Floyd Casey, d.*
- BGR*2: *Louis Bacon, cnt; Charlie Green, tbn; Clarence Williams, pno; Floyd Casey, dms.*
- BGR*3,*4: *Louis Metcalf, c; Charlie Green, tb; Clarence Williams, p; Floyd Casey, d.*
- Rust*3: *unknown -c (not Louis Bacon, says the latter); Charlie Green -tb; Clarence Williams -p; Floyd Casey -d.*
- Rust*4,*6: *Louis Metcalf, t; William W. Christian, tb; ?Clarence Williams, p; unknown d.*
- C. Hillman, Roy Palmer & Honore Dutrey, *Jazz Journal 5/86-13: "While on the subject of forgotten trombonists, I would like to make a small correction to Greg Murphy's piece about Charlie Green. Although not yet indicated so in the standard discographies, it is clear that the trombonist on Bessie Smith's Shipwreck Blues session is not Green, but Robert 'Red' Freeman, an obscure musician who was associated with Eddie Heywood Snr and recorded with him in accompaniment to Butterbeans and Susie. Comparison with Trombone Red's own Columbia session of around the same time indicates a similar personnel on the Bessie Smith item with, on aural evidence, Louis Metcalf; quite a different trumpet player from the Louis Bacon who did accompany Bessie on an earlier occasion."*
- *Storyville 51-87, Al Vollmer, Some Notes on Clarence Jones ... and Others: "In 1968 Hayes Alvis brought Louis Bacon out to my house and I started right in with the Bessie Smith session of 11 June, 1931 ... 'In The House Blues', etc., and to my surprise, he said, "Who is that on the trumpet?" "It's supposed to be you", I answered. "Oh, no," he said, "that's not me, that trumpeter is better than I am, he's doing things I never could do." He then readily identified himself on the 27 March 1930 Bessie session, and pointed out how Louis Armstrong was always his idol, and that he sought to play exactly like him. If you compare the two sessions it is readily apparent that different trumpet men are involved. Since that time, I have been intrigued by the identity of the second man, and after much deliberation decided that Louis*

Metcalf was the best bet. Recently Louis came over and I played the whole session for him and he admitted that it was he. He did not think much of his work saying, "Yes, I have to admit it, that is me. Only excuse I can make is that I was playing in the style of the time. The first thing they would ask you when they called you for a date in those days was, "Can you growl?" He identified Irvis as the trombonist, saying it was not Green, as Green was a superior trombonist with a fine tone and a real jazz background, who did not have to resort to the gimmicks used by the man here."

072 TROMBONE RED AND HIS BLUE SIX	New York,	Jun. 18, 1931
Arthur 'Pappy' Williams – tpt; Robert 'Red' Freeman – tbn, voc; Lean Spruell – alt; unknown – pno; Earl Tryce – bjo; (Eugene Hill?) or (Freddie Rastus Crump) – dms		
151615-2 Greasy Plate Stomp	Col 14612-D,	Frog DGF 38
151616-2 B Flat Blues	Col 14612-D,	Frog DGF 38

- Trumpet: everyone who knows Ellington's Okeh recording of 'Black And Tan Fantasy' of November 03, 1927, with Jabbo Smith deputizing for Bubber Miley, understands that the style of the trumpet player on the Trombone Red sides had to be assumed to be Smith's. And thus, it was established in the early Rust editions. This assumption stuck in my mind for years, although I was aware that the trumpeter on the Trombone Red sides lacked a great deal of technical facility and finesse as related to the real Jabbo. But Jabbo on a bad day ...? But the Arcadia LP cover clearly says that Jabbo was in Chicago or Milwaukee in 1931. And Jabbo himself, in a conversation during a British concert tour, denied his presence on these sides. Thus, I had to look elsewhere for the person of the trumpeter.

When compiling my Louis Metcalf list for my website "Harlem-Fuss" in 2018, I assumed Louis Metcalf to be the trumpet player, as related to Metcalf's presence on the Bessie Smith Columbia session of June 11, 1931 – just one week earlier, where he proves to be able to play in a style not otherwise attributed to him. "Yes, I have to admit it, that is me. Only excuse I can make is that I was playing in the style of the time. The first thing they would ask you when they called you for a date in those days was, "Can you growl?" (L. Metcalf in conversation with Al Vollmer, ca. 1970. And as 'Red' Freeman was declared to be the trombonist on this very session at various instances, I trusted in the notes to Frog DGF 38 listing "possibly Metcalf" on the 'Blue Six' sides, trying out on Jabbo Smith's style. This assumption I have to withdraw, now.

Finally, I came about the trumpet player on the Butterbeans & Susie sessions of January 30th and February 1st, 1930, with the name of Arthur Williams. (In the index of Rust*6 he is listed for only these two 'Butterbeans and Susie' sessions, when considering that all other nominations of his name there relate to a British trumpet player of the early 1930s of the same name!) This trumpet players' style was modeled after Louis Armstrong's style of the time, was using high interval jumps with good melodic developments and advanced harmonics, and was surprisingly modern. I was tempted to believe that he may have been a disguised Louis Metcalf. In short, he was a very interesting player without any known popularity. Williams hailed from Denver and was part of Al Bronson's band of Wichita that played under King Oliver's name, touring the mid-West in 1931/32, thus after his time with 'Red' Freeman and Butterbeans & Susie. In an interview of 1967, Frank Driggs noted: "... he (King Oliver – KBR) was crazy about "Pappy" Williams" (L. Wright, "King" Oliver). I realized that Arthur Williams was part of 'Eddie Heywood and his Sons of Harmony', and thus of factual leader Robert 'Red' Freeman's band. With Jabbo in his ear, Arthur Williams probably would be able to play in Jabbo's manner when wanted or asked. And certainly, Jabbo was some sort of musical hero among musicians of the Chicago area at this time, a trumpeter worth to be copied by aspiring young players. So, I seriously assume "Pappy" Williams to be the trumpet player on the 'Trombone Red' session. And: he is addressed by the singer as 'Pappy' in the verse of 'Greasy Plate Stomp'!

(Arthur 'Pappy' Williams can visually be found as trumpet player of the Art Bronson band – under Joe King Oliver's lead – second from left, in L. Wight's "King" Oliver, p. 152. The player fifth from left is not Walter Thomas as given, but Emmett Adams, ?alt, and first from right is Jack Holt, alt! Storyville 154-148, B. Demeusy)

- Trombone: with Robert 'Red' Freeman as distinct bandleader and trombonist – and probable singer – we do not have to search for his identity. He led a band that existed independently, becoming part of vaudeville shows, as luck – or demand or request – had it. 'Red' Freeman and his band are noted to have accompanied the vaudeville duo 'Butterbeans and Susie' from at least 1926 on, and were still with them on February 1st 1930, when Butterbeans & Susie – and adjacently Louis Armstrong with the Luis Russell band - recorded for Okeh in New York in the same studio.

On trombone Freeman uses a blues-based rudimental style, with little melodic invention and frequent repetitions of a distinct note. But he can be very sensitive and 'singable' in slow tempo, and he owns a beautiful medium vibrato coupled with nice sound when sustaining notes. He likes to use growl technique when trying to be dramatic. Freeman also must be the singer, as his vocal is accompanied by the whole band without the trombone.

- Alto sax: The alto sax player owns a thin tone – or lean, if you'd prefer – and plays in a rather simple unflexible and un-daring style, sticking to simple harmonic chord changes and phrases, using a wide vibrato. He appears to be the same man as on most of the listed and checked sides below. This would then be Lean Spruell as listed in the Chicago Defender note of May 10, 1930, or Lem Spruell as in Rust*4/*6, or Leon Spruell as in BGR*3,*4. The first name 'Lean' seems to be this musician's only documented name, and might thus be his real name – a short form of the Greek name 'Leander', perhaps - but might also be a typographical error of Leon Spruell.

- Piano: The pianist is a rather weak player in a modest Harlem-stride style, having little left-hand technique and power, and also showing a modest capability in his right-hand performance. He might be found among a large group of second or third rank pianists in New York. He definitely is not Eddie Heywood, Sr., as on the Butterbeans and Susie sides.

- Banjo: The banjoist plays an unobtrusive soft four-four style, favouring single-string technique when soloing.

- Drums: Under the long-lasting impression of observing and listening to Freddie 'Rastus' Crump in the most interesting and hilarious Vitaphone short-film 'Harlem-Mania' with the Norman Thomas Quintette, I assumed Crump being the drummer here (the use of the hi-hat-cymbal in futuristic „swing" manner, the rim-shots, and the use of the woodblock, yet with a somewhat diminished drum-set). 'Rastus' Crump also was part of the travelling show business, touring to Cuba with Gonzelle White in 1923 (with Gus Aiken, Jake Frazier, and Harry Smith), and later with the Norman Thomas Quintette (sic) before going to Europe in the early 1930s. He might have been engaged by 'Red' Freeman for recording purposes only, if at hand in New York at this time. There still is the possibility of Eugene Hill's presence – or any other drummer's from the lower ranks of Harlem musicians. But stylistically, I would opt for Rastus Crump. (Verifiably, Crump was with Norman Thomas in St. Louis, in July, and Utica, NY, in August 1931, and might well have been in the NY region in June.) If I'd be right with my assumption of Rastus Crump on these sides, this would be his only presence on record, as far as I know.

Notes:

- Mahony, Columbia 13/14000 Series: Robert 'Red' Freeman, tbn, with unknown tpt, alt, p, bjo, d.

- Rust*2: unknown (tpt); Robert Freeman (tbn); unknown (alt); unknown (bjo); Kaiser Marshall (?)(dms); unknown (vcl)

- Rust*3: Jabbo Smith -t; Robert Freeman -tb; Otto Hardwicke -as; Duke Ellington -p; Fred Guy -bj; Sonny Greer -d; unknown -v.

- Rust*4: Jabbo Smith -t; Robert Freeman -tb; Otto Hardwick -as; Duke Ellington -p; Fred Guy -bj; Sonny Greer -d

- Rust*6: unknown, t; Robert 'Red' Freeman, tb; unknown, as; unknown, p; unknown, bj; unknown, d

- Frog CD DGF 38, booklet: poss Louis Metcalf (trumpet); Robert Freeman (trombone); poss Otto Hardwick (alto sax); unknown (piano, banjo and drums)

- Storyville 5-32: "The trumpet on Trombone Red's 'B Flat Blues' would appear to be Jabbo Smith on aural evidence. We also think that Freeman is the trombone addressed as 'Red' on the Lil Hardaway and suspect that both are in fact Albert Wynn!"

- Storyville 43-28, Chris Hillman, *Some Ambiguous Cornet Players*: "The trombone on (Bessie Smith's - KBR) 'In The House Blues' date sounds too crude to be Charlie Green, but could well be Trombone Red (Robert Freeman) who can be heard with his own group, also on Columbia, just seven days later. Trombone Red's Blue Six and the group on 'In The House Blues' have a remarkably similar sound which points to the presence of the same player on both occasions. This man has the power and range and ferocity of approach which is typical of Jabbo Smith, and indeed, Smith is now generally reckoned to be in the Trombone Red group. It is interesting that on hearing 'In The House Blues' Bacon said that it was a much better player than himself. There cannot be many men who would fall into such a category at that time, for on the evidence of his two authentic Bessie Smith titles Bacon was an excellent musician, but Jabbo would certainly be one of them."

- Storyville 51-87, Al Vollmer, *Some Notes on Clarence Jones ... and Others*: "In 1968 Hayes Alvis brought Louis Bacon out to my house and I started right in with the Bessie Smith session of 11 June, 1931 ... 'In The House Blues', etc., and to my surprise, he said, "Who is that on the trumpet?" "It's supposed to be you", I answered. "Oh, no," he said, "that's not me, that trumpeter is better than I am, he's doing things I never could do." He then readily identified himself on the 27 March 1930 Bessie session, and pointed out how Louis Armstrong was always his idol, and that he sought to play exactly like him. If you compare the two sessions it is readily apparent that different trumpet men are involved. Since that time I have been intrigued by the identity of the second man, and after much deliberation decided that Louis Metcalf was the best bet. Recently Louis came over and I played the whole session for him and he admitted that it was he. He did not think much of his work saying, "Yes, I have to admit it, that is me. Only excuse I can make is that I was playing in the style of the time. The first time they would ask you when they called you for a date in those days was, "Can you growl?" He identified Irvis as the trombonist, saying it was not Green, as Green was a superior trombonist with a fine tone and a real jazz background, who did not have to resort to the gimmicks used by the man here."

- Storyville 53-164, letter from Chris Hillman: "I am glad that the identity of Bessie's 'In the House Blues' trumpeter has been resolved – but does this not perhaps have some bearing on the Trombone Red session?"

073 JONES' CHICAGO COSMOPOLITANS

Chicago,

Sep. 13, 1935

Jimmy McLeary, Louis Metcalf – tpt; Albert Wynn – tbn;

Jimmy Hutchinson, Artie Starks – alt, clt; Herschel Evans – ten;

Dave Peyton (2) or Gideon Honore (1) – pno; Hurley Ramey – gtr; Oliver Bibbs – sbs; Roy Slaughter – dms;

George D. Washington – voc

90323-A Joe Louis Chant

Dec 7115,

RST JPCD-1525-2

90324-A Baby O' Mine

Dec 7115,

RST JPCD-1525-2

This is the Dave Peyton Band of Chicago, Ill. under Richard M. Jones' name.

There is a strange sort of operatic glorification of box world-champion on the first title, interrupted by a hot trumpet chorus of which I am uncertain whether it is Metcalf or Mr. McLeary. But the second title swings like mad! If Metcalf is the trumpet soloist he definitely has slimmed his style by now and plays more horizontally. But listen to the young Herschel Evans with his break and his eight-bar tenor solo.

Notes:

- Ch. Delaunay, *New Hot Discography 1948/1963*: Louis Metcalf, Jimmy McLeary (tp); Albert Wynn (tb); Hutchinson, Artie Starks, Hershel Evans (s); Dave Peyton (2) or Gideon Honore (1)(p); Raymie Hurley (g); Oliver Bibbs (b); unknown (dm).

- Rust*2: Louis Metcalf, Jimmy McLeary (tpts); Albert Wynn (tbn); --- Hutchinson, Artie Starks (clts, alti); Herschel Evans (ten); Gideon Honore (pno) (1); Dave Payton (pno) (2); Hurley Ramey (gtr); Oliver Bibbs (sbs); unknown (dms); George D. Washington (vcl)

- Rust*3, *4, *6: Louis Metcalf -Jimmy McLeary -t; Albert Wynn -tb; --- Hutchinson -Artie Starks -cl -as; Herschel Evans -ts; Gideon Honore -p (1); Dave Payton -p (2); Hurley Ramey -g; Oliver Bibbs -sb; Roy Slaughter -d; George D. Washington -v; Richard M. Jones -dir

- Ch. Hillman, *Richard M. Jones, Forgotten Man of Jazz*: Louis Metcalf, Jimmy McLeary t; Albert Wynn tb; Jimmy 'Hooks' Hutchinson, Artie Starks cl/as; Herschel Evans ts; Dave Peyton p (1); Gideon Honore p (2); Hurley Ramey g; Oliver Bibbs sb; Roy Slaughter d; George D. Washington v; Richard M. Jones v (2)/ldr/arr. "AA and BB takes of the above also exist, musically identical to A & B. The personnel is as remembered by RMJ (Downbeat, Oct 1 1945) and confirmed by Louis Metcalf (Record Research), except that the latter identified the drummer as Benny Washington. Both remembered the guitarist as Raymie Hurley, corrected in JR4, presumably from factual information. Neither gave Hutchinson's first name, but the above thus-named sax player is documented as being active in Chicago around this time."

The following recordings by Louis Metcalf are outside the scope of my investigations and could not – by inaccessibility of the listed recordings – be checked and commented.

074 LOUIE METCALF & HIS ALL STARS

New York,

1955

Louis Metcalf – tpt;

Eddie Barefield – clt; Alva 'Boe' McCain – ten;

Ken Kersey – pno; Lord Westbrook – gtr; Lemont 'Benny' Moten – sbs; Cozy Cole – dms;

Nick Myo – voc

F8-OB-4143-10 I'm Thru With Love

Franwill F 5022

not on LP/CD ?

F8-OB-4143-1 Rock Your Blues Away

Franwill F 5022

not on LP/CD ?

Sugar Coated Love

Franwill F 5023

not on LP/CD ?

I've Got No Strings On You

Franwill F 5023

not on LP/CD ?

I Knew 'Twas You

Franwill F 5025

not on LP/CD ?

Tired

Franwill F 5025

not on LP/CD ?

075 LOUIE METCALF & HIS ALL STARS	New York,	1955
Louis Metcalf, Dick Vance – tpt; Ernie Mauro – alt; Alva ‘Boe’ McCain – ten; Garvin Bushell – bar; Ken Kersey – pno; Lord Westbrook – gtr; Lemont ‘Benny’ Moten – sbs; Cozy Cole – dms; Eddie Barefield – arr, cond		
F0-7W-0324-1 Frenchman’s Boogie	Franwill F 5026	not on LP/CD ?
F0-7W-0365-1 Under The Harlem Moon	Franwill F 5026	not on LP/CD ?
076 JAZZ IN THE SPIRIT OF ST. LOUIS	New York,	c. Sep. 1958
Louis Metcalf – tpt; <i>Gene Sedic or Prince Robinson</i> – clt; Count Hastings – ten; Freddie Washington – pno; <i>Buck Jones or Ahmed Abdul Malik</i> – sbs; Willie Wade - dms		
Oh Oh Oh	Stere-O-Craft CS503	not on LP/CD ?
Basin Street Blues	Stere-O-Craft CS503	not on LP/CD ?
Frenchman’s Boogie	Stere-O-Craft CS503	not on LP/CD ?
St. James Infirmary	Stere-O-Craft CS503	not on LP/CD ?
Clarinet Marmalade	Stere-O-Craft CS503	not on LP/CD ?
077 LOUIS METCALF ORCH.	New York,	1958
Louis Metcalf – tpt; Prince Robinson – clt; Count Hastings – ten; Freddie Washington – pno; Buck Jones – sbs; Willie Wade – dms		
Come After Breakfast	Stereo-O-Craft SS104	not on LP/CD ?
Basin Street Blues	Stereo-O-Craft SS104	not on LP/CD ?
078 LOUIS METCALF QUARTET	New York,	Jun. 1962
Louis Metcalf – tpt, voc; Clarence Johnson – pno; Lucky Fowler – gtr; Al Matthews – sbs; Herbie ‘Cat’ Cowens - dms		
The Freeze Twist (A)	Stardust 109 (45 rpm)	not on LP/CD ?
The Freeze Twist (B)	Stardust 110 (45 rpm)	not on LP/CD ?
<i>Note: Stardust is a Harrison Smith label.</i>		
079 LOUIS METCALF QUARTET	New York,	c. 1963/4
Louis Metcalf – tpt; Hank Jones – pno; Al Hall – sbs; Osie Johnson - dms		
I Don’t Want To Set The World On Fire	Grand Prix KS-400-A (LP)	not on CD ?
Let A Smile Be Your Umbrella	Grand Prix KS-400-A (LP)	not on CD ?
Wedding Bells Are Breaking Up That Old Gang Of Mine	Grand Prix KS-400-A (LP)	not on CD ?
I Left My Sugar Standing In The Rain	Grand Prix KS-400-A (LP)	not on CD ?
080 LOUIS METCALF AT THE ALIBABA	New York,	Jun. 06, 1966
Louis Metcalf – tpt, perc, voc (7,9); Sonny White – pno; Jerome Patterson – gtr; Al Matthews – sbs; Struttin’ Sam (Nelson T. Cannon) – dms, voc (3); Victoria Spivey – voc		
Little Charlie	Spivey 1007 (LP)	not on CD ?
Jay Jay	Spivey 1007 (LP)	not on CD ?
Nagasaki	Spivey 1007 (LP)	not on CD ?
Moonlight In Vermont	Spivey 1007 (LP)	not on CD ?
Four Sons	Spivey 1007 (LP)	not on CD ?
Junior’s Dance	Spivey 1007 (LP)	not on CD ?
I’ve Got The Peace Brother Blues	Spivey 1007 (LP)	not on CD ?
Savannah Is Something Else	Spivey 1007 (LP)	not on CD ?
Who Care? Nobody!!	Spivey 1007 (LP)	not on CD ?
Patrick’s Mood	Spivey 1007 (LP)	not on CD ?

Louis Metcalf’s early band memberships:

Marge Creath (c. 1918): Louis Metcalf – cnt; *William* Rollins – clt; Marge Creath – pno; Eddie Carson (Josephine Baker’s father) – dms

Charlie Creath (1918 – 1923): no personnel named

Julian Arthur’s Ten Jazz Musicians (Jimmy Cooper’s Review) (1923 - 1924): Louis Metcalf, Jim McCleary – cnt; David ‘Jelly’ James, later replaced by Jonas Walker – tbn; Eugene Sedic – clt, sax; ‘Jazz’ Curry – sax; ; Willard Hamby – pno; Walter Temple – bjo; D. Lamont, later replaced by Alex Alexander – bbs; Red Muse, later replaced by Theodore ‘Kid’ Johnson - dms

Rhythm Club House Band (1924): Louis Metcalf – tpt; Sidney Bechet, later replaced by Johnny Hodges – reeds; Willie ‘The Lion’ Smith – pno; Tommy Benford - dms

Andy Preer and his Cotton Club Syncopators (1925): R.Q. Dickerson, Louis Metcalf, later replaced by Sidney DeParis – tpt; DePriest Wheeler – tbn; David Jones, Eli Logan, Andrew Brown – reeds; Earres Prince – pno; Charlie Stamps – bjo; Jimmy Smith – bbs; Leroy Maxey – dms

Johnny Hudgins (1925): Johnny Hudgins – pantomime; Louis Metcalf, later replaced by Rex Stewart – tpt

Elmer Snowden’s Band (late 1925): Harry Cooper, Louis Metcalf – tpt; others

Charlie Johnson’s Orchestra (Feb.-Aug. 1926): Louis Metcalf, Jabbo Smith – tpt; Charlie Irvis or George Washington – tbn; Ben Whitted, Benny Carter, Ben Waters – reeds; Charlie Johnso – pno; Bobby Johnson – bjo; Cyrus St. Clair – bbs; George Stafford – dms

Four Eleven Fourty Four Show Band (Sep. 1926 – c. March 1927): 16-piece pit band, Louis Metcalf – hot man; others unknown

Charlie Johnson’s No. 2 Band (1927): Louis Metcalf – ldr, tpt; others unknown

Sam Wooding and his Orchestra (Aug. 1927 – May 1928): Bobby Martin, Tommy Ladnier, Louis Metcalf – tpt; Herb Flemming – tbn; Garvin Bushell, Willie Lewis, Gene Sedic – reeds; two unknown – vln; Sam Wooding – pno; John Mitchell – bjo; Sumner Leslie ‘King’ Edwards – bbs, sbs; *Ted Fields* - dms

Duke Ellington and his Orchestra (Nov. 1926 – Jun. 1928, regularly from May 1928): Arthur Whetsel, Louis Metcalf, Bubber Miley – tpt; Joe ‘Tricky Sam’ Nanton – tbn; Otto Hardwick, Johnny Hodges, Harry Carney, Barney Bigard – reeds; Ellington – pno; Fred Guy – bjo, gtr; Wellman Braud – sbs; Sonny Greer – dms

Jelly Roll Morton and his Orchestra (late 1928): Louis Metcalf, Edwin Swayze – tpt; Bill Cato – tbn; Joe Garland, Russell Procope – reeds; Stuff Smith – vln; Jelly Roll Morton, Luis Russell – pno; Lee Blair – bjo; Paul Barbarin - dms

Luis Russell and his Orchestra (1929): Louis Metcalf – tpt; J.C. Higginbotham – tbn; Leonard Fields, later replaced by Charlie Holmes – alt, sop; Teddy Hill – ten; Luis Russell – pno; Will Johnson – bjo, gtr; Bass Moore – bbs; Paul Barbarin – dms
(This band also recorded under the name King Oliver’s Dixie Syncopators and King Oliver and his Orchestra.)

Allie Ross and his Orchestra (Leonard Harper’s Revues at Connie’s Inn) (1929 – mid 1930): Louis Metcalf, Bubber Miley – tpt; Wilbur DeParis – tbn; Thomas ‘Fats’ Waller – org, comp; Leroy Tibbs – pno; Zutty Singleton – dms; others unknown.

Vernon Andrade and his Orchestra (Renaissance Ballroom) (1930 – 1932): Louis Metcalf, Clarence Wheeler – tpt; George Washington – tbn; Gene Mikell, Tom Thomas, Happy Caldwell – reeds; Julius Fields – pno; Vernon Andrade – bjo, gtr; unknown – sbs; Zutty Singleton – dms.

Louis Metcalf and his Orchestra (1933 – 1934): Louis Metcalf, Ward Pinkett, later replaced by Herman Autrey, George Thigpen – tpt; Jonas Walker – tbn; Happy Caldwell, unknown – reeds; Jimmy Reynolds – pno; Billy Taylor – sbs; Slick Jones – dms.

Fletcher Henderson and his Orchestra (1935): Louis Metcalf, Herman Autrey, George Thigpen, Max Maddox – tpt; Fernando Arbello, Jonas Walker – tbn; Garvin Bushell, Cecil Scott, Happy Caldwell – reeds; Fletcher Henderson – pno; Billy Taylor – sbs; Slick Jones – dms.

Louis Metcalf and his Orchestra (1935): Louis Metcalf, Ward Pinkett, George Thigpen – tpt; Charlie ‘Big’ Green – tbn; Frankie Powell, Happy Caldwell – reeds; *Jimmy Reynolds* – pno; Billy Taylor – sbs; Alfred Taylor – dms.

Dave Payton and his Orchestra (late 1935 Chicago): Jimmy McLeary, Louis Metcalf – tpt; Al Wynn – tbn; Artie Starks, *Jimmy Hutchinson*, Herschel Evans – reeds; Dave Payton – pno; Raymie Hurley – gtr; Oliver Bibbs – sbs; Benny Washington – dms.

Louis Metcalf band (1936 Buffalo, Cleveland): Louis Metcalf, Wendell Culley, Doc Cheatham – tpt; Wilbur DeParis – tbn, others unknown

Louis Metcalf band (late 1936): Louis Metcalf, Hot Lips Page – tpt; Jonas Walker – tbn; Rudy Powell, Happy Caldwell, Lester Young – reeds; unknown – pno; Clarence Holiday – gtr; Billy Taylor – sbs; Alfred Taylor – dms; Billy Holiday, Orlando Robeson – voc.